Justice

Unit 4

Essential Questions

What is the nature of justice?

How does one construct a persuasive argument?

Unit Overview

Everyone must deal with issues of justice. What is a fair consequence for breaking a rule in class? Do students have freedom of speech in school? Should the principal be allowed to search lockers randomly? You have examined culture through many lenses. You can define a culture by its beliefs about what is right and wrong—its sense of justice. Different cultures may have different standards and methods for arriving at justice, but every society has to ask the questions about what is right and fair. Unit 4 presents nonfiction, drama, and art from around the world and across time that ask the key question: What is justice?
Goals

- To examine perspectives of justice across cultures and over time
- To recognize effective elements of persuasion
- To create a persuasive piece
- To rehearse and present a dramatic interpretation

ACADEMIC VOCABULARY

Justice
Chorus

Contents

Learning Focus: What Can You Do? ........................................... 200

Activities:
4.1 Previewing the Unit ...................................................... 201
4.2 Justice in Romeo and Juliet ........................................... 202
  Drama: Excerpt from The Tragedy of Romeo and Juliet,
  by William Shakespeare
4.3 What Is Justice? ........................................................... 206
4.4 Justice and Culture ......................................................... 208
  Editorial: “Time to Assert American Values”
  Article: “Rough Justice,” by Alejandro Reyes
4.5 International Justice ...................................................... 215
  Proclamation: Declaration of the Rights of the Child
  Speech: President Mandela’s Statement on International
  Children’s Day, by Nelson Mandela
  Essay: “School’s Out for Summer,” by Anna Quindlen
4.6 Arguing for Justice ......................................................... 227
  Drama: Excerpt from The Tragedy of Julius Caesar,
  Act III, Scene 2, by William Shakespeare
4.7 Legal Justice ................................................................. 235
  Article: “An Immodest Idea,” by Anna Mulrine
  Editorial: “Comment,” by Pat Lancaster
  Article: “Germany Divided Over Hijab,” by Andreas Tzortzis
  Article: “An Unfair Dress Code?”
  Testimony: “Religious Expression,” by Nashala Hearn
4.8 Civil Disobedience ......................................................... 247
  Speech: Excerpt from “On Civil Disobedience,”
  by Mohandas K. Gandhi
  Letter: Excerpt from “Letter from Birmingham Jail,”
  by Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr.
4.9 Justice and Moral Reasoning .......................................... 256
  Informational Text: “Kohlberg’s Six Stages of Moral Reasoning”
4.10 Conflicts in Justice ....................................................... 261
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4.11 Depicting Injustice</th>
<th>Essay: “One Word of Truth Outweighs the World,” by Alexandr Solzhenitsyn</th>
<th><em>Art: Guernica, by Pablo Picasso</em></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Article:</strong> “Guernica: Testimony of War”</td>
<td><em>Photo Essay:</em> “Children Behind Bars,” by Steve Liss (or other photo essay)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.12 “Get Up, Stand Up”: Protest Music</td>
<td><strong>Embedded Assessment 1</strong> Composing a Persuasive Text</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Learning Focus:</strong> From Ancient Beliefs to Our Own</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.13 How Do You Feel?</td>
<td>272</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.14 Meet the Cadmus Family</td>
<td>275</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.15 Charting the Action</td>
<td>276</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Drama:</strong> Antigone, by Sophocles</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.16 Antigone in the Amphitheater</td>
<td>279</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.17 Creon’s Changing Character</td>
<td>284</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nonfiction:</strong> Excerpt from Making Comics, by Scott McCloud</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.18 Two Sides of the Coin</td>
<td>326</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.19 Applying Kohlberg to Antigone</td>
<td>327</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.20 Collaborative Chorus</td>
<td>330</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Embedded Assessment 2</strong> Creating a Living Tableau</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unit Reflection</strong></td>
<td>334</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>336</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>338</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>342</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Learning Focus:
What Can You Do?

Every day you encounter issues involving justice and injustice, fairness, and equal treatment. You may experience these issues in your own life, or through others that you know, or you may read about them in newspapers or hear about them on the news. Literature often deals with issues of justice and injustice. *To Kill a Mockingbird* and *Things Fall Apart* are just two examples of texts that examine issues of justice on a societal level.

Societies create systems of justice to maintain order by establishing rules and laws that reasonable people understand and abide by. Even in well-organized systems, though, there are differences of opinion about what is just, what is fair, and what is right. Instances of injustice often provoke strong emotional reactions that give rise to conflicts. Examining important social issues relating to justice demands that you examine multiple perspectives and evaluate arguments for all sides of an issue.

When presenting their support for a particular point of view, writers use persuasive language to make their cases about unjust treatment or situations. A powerful argument is crafted using emotional, logical, and ethical appeals to those who have the power to take action on an issue. To take a stand against an injustice and provide a passionate and persuasive argument that convinces others of your point of view is the responsibility and right of every effective communicator.

The leap from making your point on a personal issue of fairness to delivering a convincing argument on an issue of injustice to a broader, more demanding audience is part of expanding your personal influence into a wider arena.

**Independent Reading:** In this unit, you will read both print and nonprint texts that explore issues of justice and injustice in various cultures. For independent reading, look for a play, novel, nonfiction book, informational text, or a collection of essays or artwork that presents an aspect of justice or injustice.
Previewing the Unit

Essential Questions

1. What is the nature of justice?

2. How does one construct a persuasive argument?

Unit Overview and Learning Focus

Predict what you think this unit is about. Use the words or phrases that stood out to you when you read the Unit Overview and the Learning Focus.

Embedded Assessment

What knowledge must you have (what do you need to know)? What skills must you have (what will you need to do to complete the Embedded Assessment successfully)? Write your responses below.
Drama

ABOUT THE AUTHOR
William Shakespeare (1564–1616) is considered one of the most perceptive writers in the English language. He pursued a career in London as an actor but found more success as a playwright and poet, producing more than three dozen plays and many sonnets that are still performed and read today. His strength as a writer was in his ability to portray basic human emotions and situations in memorable, often heart-breaking, verse.

Excerpt from Romeo and Juliet by William Shakespeare

Summary: Two families—the Montagues and the Capulets—are enemies. Romeo, a Montague, has killed Tybalt, a Capulet, after Tybalt killed Romeo's friend, Mercutio. Both sides appeal to the Prince for justice. Benvolio pleads for the Montagues, while Lady Capulet speaks for her family. As you read, mark the text by underlining words and phrases related to justice.

ACT III, SCENE 1:

PRINCE
Where are the vile beginners of this fray?

BENVOLIO
O noble prince, I can discover all
The unlucky manage of this fatal brawl:
There lies the man, slain by young Romeo,
That slew thy kinsman, brave Mercutio.
ISMENE All right then, go, if that’s what you think right.
But remember this—even though your mission makes no sense, your friends do truly love you.

[Exit Antigone and Ismene. Enter the Chorus of Theban elders]

FIRST ODE

CHORUS – Strophe 1

O ray of sunlight,
most beautiful that ever shone
on Thebes, city of the seven gates,
you’ve appeared at last,
you glowing eye of golden day,
moving above the streams of Dirce,
driving into headlong flight
the white-shield warrior from Argos,
who marched here fully armed,
now forced back by your sharper power.

CHORUS LEADER Against our land he marched,
sent here by the warring claims
of Polyneices, with piercing screams,
an eagle flying above our land,
covered wings as white as snow,
and hordes of warriors in arms,
helmets topped with horsehair crests.

CHORUS – Antistrophe 1

Standing above our homes,
he ranged around our seven gates,
with threats to swallow us
and spears thirsting to kill.

Before his jaws had had their fill
and gorged themselves on Theban blood,
before Hephaistos’ pine-torch flames
had seized our towers, our fortress crown,
he went back, driven in retreat.
Behind him rings the din of war—
his enemy, the Theban dragon-snake,
too difficult for him to overcome.

CHORUS LEADER Zeus hates an arrogant boasting tongue.
Seeing them march here in a mighty stream,

---

5 First Ode: odes are choral songs chanted by the Chorus in a Greek tragedy
6 Strophe 1: part of the ode the Chorus chants while moving right to left across the stage
7 streams of Dirce: stream near Thebes
8 Antistrophe 1: part of the ode the Chorus chants while moving back across the stage from left to right
9 Hephaistos: blacksmith of the gods; he hammered out lightning bolts for Zeus
LADY CAPULET
Tybalt, my cousin! O my brother’s child!
O prince! O cousin! husband! O, the blood is spilt
Of my dear kinsman! Prince, as thou art true,
For blood of ours, shed blood of Montague.
O cousin, cousin!

PRINCE
Benvolio, who began this bloody fray?

BENVOLIO
Tybalt, here slain, whom Romeo’s did slay;
Romeo that spoke him fair, bade him bethink
How nice the quarrel was, and urged withal
Your high displeasure: all this uttered
With gentle breath, calm look, knees humbly bow’d,
Could not take truce with the unruly spleen
Of Tybalt deaf to peace, but that he tilts
With piercing steel at bold Mercutio’s breast,
Who all as hot, turns deadly point to point,
And, with a martial scorn, with one hand beats
Cold death aside, and with the other sends
It back to Tybalt, whose dexterity,
Retorts it: Romeo he cries aloud,
‘Hold, friends! friends, part!’ and, swifter than
his tongue,
His agile arm beats down their fatal points,
And ’twixt them rushes; underneath whose arm
An envious thrust from Tybalt hit the life
Of stout Mercutio, and then Tybalt fled;
But by and by comes back to Romeo,
Who had but newly entertain’d revenge,
And to ’t they go like lightning, for, ere I
Could draw to part them, was stout Tybalt slain.
And, as he fell, did Romeo turn and fly.
This is the truth, or let Benvolio die.

2 nice: trivial
LADY CAPULET
He is a kinsman to the Montague;
Affection makes him false; he speaks not true:
Some twenty of them fought in this black strife,
And all those twenty could but kill one life.
I beg for justice, which thou, prince, must give;
Romeo slew Tybalt, Romeo must not live.

PRINCE
Romeo slew him, he slew Mercutio;
Who now the price of his dear blood doth owe?

MONTAGUE
Not Romeo, prince, he was Mercutio's friend;
His fault concludes but what the law should end,
The life of Tybalt.

PRINCE
And for that offence
Immediately we do exile him hence:
I have an interest in your hate's proceeding,
My blood for your rude brawls doth lie a-bleeding;
But I'll amerce you with so strong a fine
That you shall all repent the loss of mine:
I will be deaf to pleading and excuses;
Nor tears nor prayers shall purchase out abuses:
Therefore use none: let Romeo hence in haste,
Else, when he's found, that hour is his last.
Bear hence this body and attend our will:
Mercy but murders, pardoning those that kill.
Exeunt
1. This scene seems as though it could be played in a TV courtroom drama.
   a. Who is being accused of a crime?
   b. What is the crime?
   c. Who is the judge?
   d. Who provides eyewitness testimony? Is this testimony impartial? Why do you think this?
   e. What is the sentence?

2. Both the Capulets and the Montagues ask the Prince for justice.
   a. What do the Capulets ask for, and why do they think that would be a just decision?

   b. What do the Montagues want, and why do they believe that justice has already been served?

   c. Why is neither family satisfied with the verdict?

   d. Is the Prince an impartial judge of the case?

3. Is the Prince’s decision just? Explain.

4. If this case were being decided in a real courtroom today, what do you expect Romeo’s punishment would be? Explain.

5. What does this scene reveal to you about the nature of justice? Be sure to provide support for your thoughts from the text.
Think about the following terms and, in the chart, write associations you have about them.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>What words come to mind when you see or hear these terms?</th>
<th>What has influenced your opinion of these terms?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Justice, justice system</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laws, rules, codes, constitution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judge, jury, lawyers, witnesses, prosecutor, defendant, victim</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics, morality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punishment, rehabilitation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

After you have shared your thoughts as a class, go back to your work with forms of the word *just* and add terms that help you understand justice. Explain how the terms relate to the concept of *justice*.

Now, using the ideas you have recorded, write a personal definition of the word *justice*. What does justice mean to you? Share your definition with a partner.
Quickwrite: Now complete the quickwrite below about a time in which justice was served and a time it was not. You may write about a personal experience or something you learned from the news. Share your quickwrite with a partner when you have finished.

Justice—a time it was served:

Justice—a time it was not served:

Discussion: After you have heard from others in the class, discuss why it is important to have a justice system in society.
1. **Quickwrite:** Imagine that you, an American teenager, went out one night with some friends and vandalized a car and street signs. Imagine then that you were arrested by the police. What do you expect your punishment would be? Would it involve jail time, repairing the damage, or some other penalty? How do you think justice would be best served?

2. **Quickwrite:** What is the attitude toward vandalism of this nature in your family? In your school? In your community?

3. **Quickwrite:** In Unit 3, when you read the novel *Things Fall Apart*, you may have thought about what happens when cultures have different perspectives on issues of justice. What do you think might be the response to this kind of vandalism in another country?
Michael Fay Controversy

Background Information

Michael Fay, an American teenager living in Singapore, was arrested in 1994 for possession of stolen street signs and for vandalism of automobiles. The criminal justice system in Singapore sentenced Fay to a series of “canings,” in which the accused is struck several times on the buttocks with a long, rattan cane. Amnesty International has declared this punishment “torture.”

Before the punishment was carried out, Fay’s father publicized his case all over America, hoping that people would be so horrified by the act that they would protest. What the case touched off instead was a huge debate over the effectiveness of such punishments on criminals. Proponents of caning pointed out that Singapore has very little crime, while America provides its criminals with cable TV. The case dominated much of talk radio in the months leading up to the scheduled caning.

The Clinton Administration did intervene somewhat and was able to get the number of strokes reduced. In the end, Fay was struck four times with the cane, and the case—and Fay—slipped out of the public’s mind.

The Michael Fay case generated a lot of publicity. Newspaper reporters and editorial writers expressed different points of view on whether the punishment was justified.

- If a reporter thought that the punishment was unjustified, what kinds of words and phrases would you expect him or her to use to describe the caning and Fay himself?
- If a reporter thought that the punishment was justified, what kinds of words and phrases might you expect him or her to use to describe the caning and Michael Fay?

Forms of Evidence

When presenting an argument, writers use evidence to support their positions. For example:

- **Empirical evidence** is based on experiences and direct observation through research.
- **Logical evidence** is based on facts and a clear rationale.
- **Anecdotal evidence** is based on personal accounts of incidents.

Anecdotal evidence is the least reliable because it may have been passed from one person to another to another. As you read pages 210-214, look for the evidence presented to support the arguments. Mark the text to identify each type of evidence, and discuss with peers the effect of that persuasive technique on the text as a whole as well as its impact on the reader.
Directions: Skim the following two articles from the *New York Times* and determine whether each writer is a proponent of Fay’s punishment or is opposed to the punishment. Mark the text, indicating words and phrases that indicate the writer’s stance. Take notes in the My Notes section about any biases you detect. At the top of the page, write For or Against.

**Editorial**

**Time to Assert AMERICAN VALUES**

from The New York Times

Singapore’s founding leader, Lee Kuan Yew, returned to a favorite theme yesterday in defending the threatened caning of Michael Fay, an 18-year-old American found guilty of vandalism. Western countries value the individual above society; in Asia, he said, the good of society is deemed more important than individual liberties. This comfortable bit of sophistry helps governments from China to Indonesia rationalize abuses and marginalize courageous people who campaign for causes like due process and freedom from torture. Western nations, it is asserted, have no right to impose their values on countries that govern themselves successfully according to their own values.

So, the argument goes, when Americans express outrage over a punishment that causes permanent scarring—in this case, caning—they are committing an act of cultural arrogance, assuming that American values are intrinsically superior to those of another culture.

There is a clear problem with this argument. It assumes that dissidents, democrats and reformers in these countries are somehow less authentic representatives of their cultures than the members of the political elite who enforce oppressive punishments and suppress individual rights.

At times like this, Americans need to remember that this country was also founded by dissidents—by people who were misfits in their own society because they believed, among other things, that it was wrong to punish pilferage with hanging or crimes of any sort with torture.

---

1 Sophistry: false or misleading argument
These are values worth asserting around the world. Americans concerned with the propagation of traditional values at home should be equally energetic in asserting constitutional principles in the international contest of ideas. There are millions of acts of brutality that cannot be exposed and combated. A case like Michael Fay’s is important because it provides a chance to challenge an inhumane practice that ought not to exist anywhere.

While this country cannot dictate to the Government of Singapore, no one should fail to exhort it to behave mercifully. President Clinton provided a sound example when he called for a pardon. Principled private citizens ought now to call for American companies doing business in Singapore to bring their influence to bear.

Our colleague William Safire is right to call upon American corporations with subsidiaries in Singapore to press President Ong Teng Cheong to cancel Mr. Fay’s punishment. According to Dun & Bradstreet and the U.S.-Asean Council, some C.E.O’s and companies in this category are: Riley P. Bechtel of the Bechtel Group Inc.; John S. Reed of Citicorp; Roberto C. Goizueta of the Coca-Cola Company Inc.; Edgar S. Woolard Jr. of E. I. du Pont de Nemours & Company; Lee R. Raymond of Exxon Corporation; John F. Welch Jr. of the General Electric Company; Michael R. Bonsignore of Honeywell Inc.; Louis V. Gerstner Jr. of the International Business Machines Corporation, and Ralph S. Larsen of Johnson & Johnson Inc.

Singapore needs such people as friends. Now is the time for them to make their voices heard. The Fay case provides a legitimate opening for American citizens and companies to bring political and economic pressure to bear in the propagation\(^2\) of freedom and basic rights. Former President Bush can lead the effort by using his speech at a Citibank seminar in Singapore Thursday to call for clemency for Michael Fay.

---

\(^2\) **propagation**: dissemination; spread
A Caning in Singapore Stirs Up a Fierce Debate About Crime and Punishment

by Alejandro Reyes

The Vandalism Act of 1966 was originally conceived as a legal weapon to combat the spread of mainly political graffiti common during the heady days of Singapore’s struggle for independence. Enacted a year after the republic left the Malaysian Federation, the law explicitly mandates between three and eight strokes of the cane for each count, though a provision allows first offenders to escape caning “if the writing, drawing, mark or inscription is done with pencil, crayon, chalk or other delible substances and not with paint, tar or other indelible substances....”

Responding to reporters’ questions, U.S. chargé d'affaires Ralph Boyce said: “We see a large discrepancy between the offense and the punishment. The cars were not permanently damaged; the paint was removed with thinner. Caning leaves permanent scars. In addition, the accused is a teenager and this is his first offense.”

By evening, the Singapore government had its reply: “Unlike some other societies which may tolerate acts of vandalism, Singapore has its own standards of social order as reflected in our laws. It is because of our tough laws against anti-social crimes that we are able to keep Singapore orderly and relatively crime-free.” The statement noted that in the past five years, fourteen young men aged 18 to 21, twelve of whom were Singaporean, had been sentenced to caning for vandalism. Fay’s arrest and sentencing shook the American community in Singapore. Schools advised parents to warn their children not to get into trouble. The American Chamber of Commerce said “We simply do not understand how the government can condone the permanent scarring of any 18-year-old boy—American or Singaporean—by caning for such an offense.” Two dozen American senators signed a letter to Ong on Fay’s behalf.

But according to a string of polls, Fay’s caning sentence struck a chord in the U.S. Many Americans fed up with rising crime in their cities actually supported the tough punishment. Singapore’s embassy in Washington said that the mail it had received was overwhelmingly approving of the tough sentence. And a radio call-in survey in Fay’s hometown of Dayton, Ohio, was strongly pro-caning.
It wasn’t long before Singapore patriarch Lee Kuan Yew weighed in. He reckoned the whole affair revealed America’s moral decay. “The U.S. government, the U.S. Senate and the U.S. media took the opportunity to ridicule us, saying the sentence was too severe,” he said in a television interview. “[The U.S.] does not restrain or punish individuals, forgiving them for whatever they have done. That’s why the whole country is in chaos: drugs, violence, unemployment and homelessness. The American society is the richest and most prosperous in the world but it is hardly safe and peaceful.”

The debate over caning put a spotlight on Singapore’s legal system. Lee and the city-state’s other leaders are committed to harsh punishments. Preventive detention laws allow authorities to lock up suspected criminals without trial. While caning is mandatory in cases of vandalism, rape and weapons offenses, it is also prescribed for immigration violations such as overstaying visas and hiring of illegal workers. The death penalty is automatic for drug trafficking and firing a weapon while committing a crime. At dawn on May 13, six Malaysians were hanged for drug trafficking, bringing to seventeen the number executed for such offenses so far this year, ten more than the total number of prisoners executed in all of 1993.

Most Singaporeans accept their brand of rough justice. Older folk readily speak of the way things were in the 1950s and 1960s when secret societies and gangs operated freely. Singapore has succeeded in keeping crime low. Since 1988, government statistics show there has been a steady decline in the crime rate from 223 per 10,000 residents to 175 per 10,000 last year. Authorities are quick to credit their tough laws and harsh penalties for much of that.…

“If there is a single fundamental difference between the Western and Asian world view, it is the dichotomy between individual freedom and collective welfare,” said Singapore businessman and former journalist Ho Kwon Ping in an address to lawyers on May 5, the day Fay was caned. “The Western cliché that it would be better for a guilty person to go free than to convict an innocent person is testimony to the importance of the individual. But an Asian perspective may well be that it is better that an innocent person be convicted if the common welfare is protected than for a guilty person to be free to inflict further harm on the community.”

There is a basic difference too in the way the law treats a suspect. “In Britain and in America, they keep very strongly to the presumption of innocence,” says Walter Woon, associate professor of law at the National University of Singapore and a nominated MP. “The prosecution must prove that you are guilty. And even if the judge may feel that you are guilty, he
cannot convict you unless the prosecution has proven it. So in some cases it becomes a game between the defense and the prosecuting counsel. We would rather convict even if it doesn't accord with the purist's traditions of the presumption of innocence.”

Singapore’s legal system may be based on English common law, but it has developed its own legal traditions and philosophy since independence. The recent severance of all appeals to the Privy Council in London is part of that process. In fundamental ways, Singapore has departed from its British legal roots. The city-state eliminated jury trials years ago—the authorities regard them as error-prone. Acquittals can be appealed and are sometimes overturned. And judges have increased sentences on review. Recently an acquittal was overturned and a bus driver was sentenced to death for murder based only on circumstantial evidence. “Toughness is considered a virtue here,” says Woon. “The system is stacked against criminals. The theory is that a person shouldn’t get off on fancy argument.”

Woon opposes caning to punish non-violent offenses. But he is not an admirer of the American system. Last year, Woon and his family were robbed at gunpoint at a bus stop near Disneyworld in Orlando, Florida. The experience shook him. America’s legal system, he argues, “has gone completely berserk. They’re so mesmerized by the rights of the individual that they forget that other people have rights too. There's all this focus on the perpetrator and his rights, and they forget the fellow is a criminal.” Fay is no more than that, Woon says. “His mother and father have no sense of shame. Do they not feel any shame for not having brought him up properly to respect other people's property? Instead they consider themselves victims.”

Yet harsh punishments alone are clearly not the salvation of Singapore society. The predominantly Chinese city-state also has a cohesive value system that emphasizes such Confucian virtues as respect for authority, “No matter how harsh your punishments, you’re not going to get an orderly society unless the culture is in favor of order,” says Woon. “In Britain and America, they seem to have lost the feeling that people are responsible for their own behavior. Here, there is still a sense of personal responsibility. If you do something against the law, you bring shame not only to yourself but to your family.”

That “sense of shame,” Woon reckons, is more powerful than draconian laws. “Loosening up won’t mean there will be chaos,” he says. “But the law must be seen to work. The punishment is not the main thing. It’s the enforcement of the law. The law has to be enforced effectively and fairly.”
**Anticipation Guide**

Mark whether you agree or disagree with each of the statements below. You will have an opportunity to revisit these statements later in the unit to see if you still hold the same opinion.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Now</th>
<th>Later</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Different cultures cannot agree on what is just.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Children and teenagers are given special protection.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The physical needs of children and teenagers are a high priority.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The emotional needs of children and teenagers are a high priority.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Children and teenagers should be required to attend school.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Children and teenagers are protected against all forms of neglect, cruelty, and exploitation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Children and teenagers face discrimination.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To which of the statements above do you respond most strongly? List your reasons below.
Before Reading

Imagine a country whose culture has always had a deep-seated fear of red hair, has passed a law that says that all red-haired children are to be banished when they turn 10. Is this a just law? How do you determine a law’s justness? Can you remove it from culture, time, and place and still have it be relevant? How are laws established in a state? In a country? How would you go about changing our country’s laws?

The United Nations is an organization that tries to determine issues of justice that transcend individual cultures and societal rules. What do you know about the United Nations? Are there any laws to which all nations on the planet would agree?

Think about children (defined as any person under the age of 18, unless an earlier age of majority is recognized by a country's law) around the world. If all nations could agree on a set of laws that concern the treatment of children, what kinds of laws do you think would appear on the list of laws?

During Reading

Read the Declaration of the Rights of the Child. Next to each Principle, sketch an illustration or symbolic representation of that Principle.

Next, read President Nelson Mandela’s Statement on International Children’s Day. In this statement, Mandela recaps programs put in place by the South African government. Next to each, note what kinds of similar programs you have heard about in your community or state.

Mandela also mentions issues under “urgent consideration.” What is the situation regarding these issues in your community? Make notes in the margin.
After Reading

After reading the declaration and Mandela’s proclamation, form discussion groups and answer this question: Do you believe that the principles are being met in the United States? In the rest of the world?

When you attempt to convince others to agree with you about a statement, remember to adhere to the discussion norms of your class. One way to show respect to your classmates is to acknowledge and even paraphrase what the person just said before you respond. For example:

- “I understand when you say . . . (paraphrase). To that idea, I would like to add . . . ”
- “When you said . . . (paraphrase), did you also think about . . . ?”
- “You made a good point when you said . . . (paraphrase). I’d also like to suggest . . . ”

WORD CONNECTIONS

Adhere contains the root -her-, from the Latin word haerere, meaning “to stick.” This root also appears in cohere, hereditary, and inherit. The prefix ad- means “to.”
Proclamation

DECLARATION
of the RIGHTS
of the CHILD

PROCLAIMED BY GENERAL ASSEMBLY RESOLUTION 1386(XIV)
OF 20 NOVEMBER 1959

Whereas the peoples of the United Nations have, in the Charter, reaffirmed their faith in fundamental human rights and in the dignity and worth of the human person, and have determined to promote social progress and better standards of life in larger freedom,

Whereas the United Nations has, in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, proclaimed that everyone is entitled to all the rights and freedoms set forth therein, without distinction of any kind, such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status,

Whereas the child, by reason of his physical and mental immaturity, needs special safeguards and care, including appropriate legal protection, before as well as after birth,

Whereas the need for such special safeguards has been stated in the Geneva Declaration of the Rights of the Child of 1924, and recognized in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and in the statutes of specialized agencies and international organizations concerned with the welfare of children,

Whereas mankind owes to the child the best it has to give,

Now therefore,

The General Assembly

Proclaims this Declaration of the Rights of the Child to the end that he may have a happy childhood and enjoy for his own good and for the good of society the rights and freedoms herein set forth, and calls upon parents, upon men and women as individuals, and upon voluntary organizations, local authorities and national Governments to recognize these rights and strive for their observance by legislative and other measures progressively taken in accordance with the following principles:
**Principle 1**

The child shall enjoy all the rights set forth in this Declaration. Every child, without any exception whatsoever, shall be entitled to these rights, without distinction or discrimination on account of race, color, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status, whether of himself or of his family.

**Principle 2**

The child shall enjoy special protection, and shall be given opportunities and facilities, by law and by other means, to enable him to develop physically, mentally, morally, spiritually and socially in a healthy and normal manner and in conditions of freedom and dignity. In the enactment of laws for this purpose, the best interests of the child shall be the paramount consideration.

**Principle 3**

The child shall be entitled from his birth to a name and a nationality.

**Principle 4**

The child shall enjoy the benefits of social security. He shall be entitled to grow and develop in health; to this end, special care and protection shall be provided both to him and to his mother, including adequate pre-natal and post-natal care. The child shall have the right to adequate nutrition, housing, recreation and medical services.

**Principle 5**

The child who is physically, mentally or socially handicapped shall be given the special treatment, education and care required by his particular condition.

**Principle 6**

The child, for the full and harmonious development of his personality, needs love and understanding. He shall, wherever possible, grow up in the care and under the responsibility of his parents, and, in any case, in an atmosphere of affection and of moral and material security; a child of tender years shall not, save in exceptional circumstances, be separated from his mother. Society and the public authorities shall have the duty to extend particular care to children without a family and to those without adequate means of support. Payment of State and other assistance towards the maintenance of children of large families is desirable.

**Principle 7**

The child is entitled to receive education, which shall be free and compulsory, at least in the elementary stages. He shall be given an education which will promote his general culture and enable him, on a basis of equal opportunity, to develop his abilities, his individual judgement, and his sense of moral and social responsibility, and to become a useful member of society.

The best interests of the child shall be the guiding principle of those responsible for his education and guidance; that responsibility lies in the first place with his parents.
The child shall have full opportunity for play and recreation, which should be directed to the same purposes as education; society and the public authorities shall endeavour to promote the enjoyment of this right.

**Principle 8**
The child shall in all circumstances be among the first to receive protection and relief.

**Principle 9**
The child shall be protected against all forms of neglect, cruelty and exploitation. He shall not be the subject of traffic, in any form.

The child shall not be admitted to employment before an appropriate minimum age; he shall in no case be caused or permitted to engage in any occupation or employment which would prejudice his health or education, or interfere with his physical, mental or moral development.

**Principle 10**
The child shall be protected from practices which may foster racial, religious and any other form of discrimination. He shall be brought up in a spirit of understanding, tolerance, friendship among peoples, peace and universal brotherhood, and in full consciousness that his energy and talents should be devoted to the service of his fellow men.
PRESIDENT NELSON MANDELA’S STATEMENT ON INTERNATIONAL CHILDREN’S DAY

1 June 1994

Today, 1 June, is International Children’s Day.

I wish to take this opportunity to reiterate the commitment of the South African Government to a comprehensive programme to ensure that children of our country grow up secure in family life, enjoying all the rights and privileges they deserve. We recommit ourselves to the UN Declaration on the Rights of the Child.

In order to realise these objectives, the Government has already set in motion mechanisms to implement various programmes that we announced at the Opening of the last Parliamentary Session. These include:

• Free medical care in state hospitals and clinics for children under six years of age: A decision has been taken that this should come into effect immediately where mechanisms have been put in place, and it will apply to all cases where such a need exists.

• A nutritional feeding scheme in primary schools: The relevant ministry is already identifying the areas most in need for the urgent implementation of this measure.

• The Departments of Justice and Welfare will soon announce a detailed programme to empty our jails of children and to provide alternative care centres.

• Legislation to introduce free and quality education for all children will be introduced at the next parliamentary session.

ABOUT THE AUTHOR
Nelson Mandela (1918–) spent nearly three decades in South African prisons and, as a result, became an international symbol of the injustice of South African apartheid, a system of political, economic, and social segregation. After his release in 1990, Mandela helped dismantle apartheid. He and President F.W. de Klerk won the 1993 Nobel Prize for Peace for their efforts. A year later, Mandela ran for president in the first all-race elections held in South Africa and won. He served as South Africa’s president until 1999.
Among the measures that are also under urgent consideration are the conditions of street children, and ways in which the Government can contribute to alleviate and finally eradicate their plight. Further, legislation on the eradication of child abuse and child labour will be processed with deliberate speed.

On this day, we also extend our solidarity with children throughout the world whose lives are ravaged by the scourges of hunger, war and ignorance. We commit ourselves to contribute, to the best of our ability, to the international efforts aimed at resolving these problems.

The South African Government’s approach to the question of children’s social and political rights derives from the basic principle that to value our children is to value our future.
WHEN THE AD COUNCIL CONVENED focus groups not long ago to help prepare a series of public service announcements on child hunger, there was a fairly unanimous response from the participants about the subject. Not here. Not in America. If there was, we would know about it. We would read about it in the paper, we would see it on the news. And of course we would stop it. In America.

Is it any wonder that the slogan the advertising people came up with was “The Sooner You Believe It, the Sooner We Can End It”?

It’s the beginning of summer in America’s cement cities, in the deep hidden valleys of the country and the loop-de-loop sidewalkless streets of the suburbs. For many adults who are really closet kids, this means that their blood hums with a hint of freedom, the old beloved promise of long aimless days of dirt and sweat and sunshine, T-shirts stained with Kool-Aid and flip-flops gray with street grit or backyard dust.

But that sort of summer has given way to something more difficult, even darker, that makes you wonder whether year-round school is not a notion whose time has come. With so many households in which both parents are working, summer is often a scramble of scheduling: day camps, school programs, the Y, the community center. Some parents who can't afford or find those kinds of services park their vacationing children in front of the television, lock the door, and go to work hoping for the best, calling home on the hour. Some kids just wander in a wilder world than the one that existed when their parents had summers free.

And some kids don’t get enough to eat, no matter what people want to tell themselves. Do the math: During the rest of the year fifteen million students get free or cut-rate lunches at school, and many of them get breakfast, too. But only three million children are getting lunches through the federal

ABOUT THE AUTHOR
Anna Quindlen is a novelist and an award-winning and popular newspaper columnist who has written for some of the nation’s most prestigious newspapers, including The New York Times, where she was a reporter, editor, and contributor for many years. Critics suggest that her appeal as a columnist lies in her personal approach and her insights into problems experienced by ordinary readers. She won the Pulitzer Prize for commentary in 1992.

© 2011 College Board. All rights reserved.
summer lunch program. And hunger in the United States, particularly since the institution of so-called welfare reform, is epidemic. The numbers are astonishing in the land of the all-you-can-eat buffet. The Agriculture Department estimated in 1999 that twelve million children were hungry or at risk of going hungry. A group of big-city mayors released a study showing that in 2000, requests for food assistance from families increased almost 20 percent, more than at any time in the last decade. And last Thanksgiving a food bank in Connecticut gave away four thousand more turkeys than the year before—and still ran out of birds.

But while the Christmas holidays make for heartrending copy, summer is really ground zero in the battle to keep kids fed. The school lunch program, begun in the 1970s as a result of bipartisan federal legislation, has been by most measures an enormous success. For lots of poor families it’s become a way to count on getting at least one decent meal into their children, and when it disappears it’s catastrophic. Those who work at America’s Second Harvest, the biggest nonprofit supply source for food banks, talk of parents who go hungry themselves so their kids can eat, who put off paying utility and phone bills, who insist their children attend remedial summer school programs simply so they can get a meal. The parents themselves are loath to talk: Of all the humiliations attached to being poor in a prosperous nation, not being able to feed your kids is at the top of the list.

In most cases these are not parents who are homeless or out of work. The people who run food banks report that most of their clients are minimum-wage workers who can’t afford enough to eat on their salaries. “Families are struggling in a way they haven’t done for a long time,” says Brian Loring, the executive director of Neighborhood Centers of Johnson County, Iowa, which provides lunches to more than two hundred kids at five locations during the summer months. For a significant number of Americans, the cost of an additional meal for two school-age children for the eight weeks of summer vacation seems like a small fortune. Some don’t want or seek government help because of the perceived stigma; some are denied food stamps because of new welfare policies. Others don’t know they’re eligible, and none could be blamed if they despaired of the exercise. The average length of a food stamp application is twelve often impenetrable pages; a permit to sell weapons is just two.

The success of the school lunch program has been, of course, that the food goes where the children are. That’s the key to success for summer programs, too. Washington, D.C., has done better than any other city in the country in feeding hungry kids, sending fire trucks into housing projects to distribute leaflets about lunch locations, running a referral hotline and radio announcements. One food bank in Nevada decided to send trucks to the parks for tailgate lunches. “That’s where the kids are,” its director told the people at Second Harvest.

---

1 *bipartisan*: supported by both major political parties

2 *stigma*: sign of shame or disgrace
We Americans like need that takes place far from home, so we can feel simultaneously self-congratulatory and safe from the possibility that hard times could be lurking around the corner. Maybe that’s why our mothers told us to think of the children in Africa when we wouldn’t clean our plates. I stopped believing in that when I found myself in a bodega with a distraught woman after New York City had declared a snow day; she had three kids who ate breakfast and lunch at school, her food stamps had been held up because of some bureaucratic snafu, and she was considering whether to pilfer food from the senior center where she worked as an aide. Surely there should be ways for a civilized society to see that such a thing would never happen, from providing a simpler application for food stamps to setting a decent minimum wage. But wishing don’t make it so, as they say in policy meetings, and proposals aren’t peanut butter and jelly. Find a food bank and then go grocery shopping by proxy. Somewhere nearby there is a mother who covets a couple of boxes of spaghetti, and you could make her dream come true. That’s right. In America.

In her essay “School’s Out for Summer,” Anna Quindlen makes an argument about the implementation of one of the principles in America. As you read the first six paragraphs, identify her hook and her thesis by marking the text. What solutions does Quindlen present? What solutions can you and your classmates add?

---

3 bodega: small grocery shop
4 snafu: a confusing situation
5 proxy: to act in the place of someone else
Take a few minutes to assess your skills in the areas of speaking and listening in group discussions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>My Strengths as a Listener</th>
<th>My Weaknesses as a Listener</th>
<th>Goals for Improvement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>My Strengths as a Speaker</th>
<th>My Weaknesses as a Speaker</th>
<th>Goals for Improvement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reflect on how well you and your group adhered to the norms of discussion during this activity. Include in your reflection how the discussion norms connect to speaking and listening skills.
Writing Prompt: Scenario A—You arrive home 20 minutes after your curfew and your parent or guardian has decided to ground you for a week as punishment. On separate paper, try to persuade your parent or guardian to change his or her mind by using one of three types of arguments explained below.

Argument 1: Appeal to your parent or guardian by showing that you are trustworthy and that you care deeply about the situation and its effect on them. You should use “I.”

Argument 2: Appeal to your parent or guardian by telling a story with lots of details to create pity for yourself and your situation. You can use “I,” though you may refer to other people as well.

Argument 3: Appeal to your parent or guardian by being rational and by giving statistics and commonly held beliefs. Refer to experts and facts that can be supported and explained. You should use “I” sparingly.

Types of Appeals
Sketch a symbol to represent each of these types of persuasive appeals.

Logos (Logical): This type of appeal uses inductive or deductive reasoning by citing statistics, facts, experts, and evidence. When using this type of argument, you offer your audience examples that are similar to this subject and convince them to draw the conclusion you want. How did you use logos in Argument 3 above?

Ethos (Ethical): This type of argument requires that you establish yourself as trustworthy and respectful of the audience. You do this by demonstrating that you have taken the time to research your topic, which establishes your credibility on the subject. How did you use ethos in Argument 1 above?

Pathos (Emotional): This is when you appeal to the emotions of your audience by describing in detail the effect of a particular situation. You should try to arouse a sense of pity, anger, fear, or other emotion in your audience. How did you use pathos in Argument 2 above?

Writing Prompt: Scenario B—Your community recreation center could sponsor free lunches for children and teenagers during the summer but does not currently do so. Using the appeals of logos, ethos, and pathos, write an essay in which you convince the director to sponsor free lunches.
As you read this scene from *Julius Caesar*, notice how Antony is able to persuade his audience. After you read the scene, use the SMELL reading strategy to help you understand how Antony persuades the crowd.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Sender-receiver relationship</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is the relationship between Antony, the sender of the message, and the crowd?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How does Antony respond to the crowd?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Message</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Summarize Antony’s argument.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Emotional strategies</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What does he want the crowd to think, feel, and do?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Logical strategies</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What logic is Antony using?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How does this logic affect his message?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Language</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What kinds of words and images does Antony use?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How does Antony’s word choice affect the speech?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
by William Shakespeare

ACT III, SCENE 2

Antony
Friends, Romans, countrymen, lend me your ears.
I come to bury Caesar, not to praise him.
The evil that men do lives after them;
The good is oft interned with their bones.
So let it be with Caesar. The noble Brutus
Hath told you Caesar was ambitious.
If it were so, it was a grievous fault,
And grievously hath Caesar answered it.
Here, under leave of Brutus and the rest—
For Brutus is an honorable man
So are they all, all honorable men—
Come I to speak in Caesar's funeral.
He was my friend, faithful and just to me;
But Brutus says he was ambitious,
And Brutus is an honorable man.
He hath brought many captives home to Rome,
Whose ransoms did the general coffers' fill.
Did this in Caesar seem ambitious?
When that the poor have cried, Caesar hath wept;
Ambition should be made of sterner stuff.
Yet Brutus says he was ambitious,
And Brutus is an honorable man.
You all did see that on the Lupercal
I thrice presented him a kingly crown,
Which he did thrice refuse. Was this ambition?
Yet Brutus says he was ambitious,
And sure he is an honorable man.
I speak not to disprove what Brutus spoke,
But here I am to speak what I do know.
You all did love him once, not without cause
What cause withholds you, then, to mourn for him?
O judgment! Thou art fled to brutish beasts,
And men have lost their reason. Bear with me;
My heart is in the coffin there with Caesar,
And I must pause till it come back to me. [He weeps.]

1 coffers: treasury
Arguing for Justice

**First Plebeian**
Methinks there is much reason in his sayings.

**Second Plebeian**
If thou consider rightly of the matter, Caesar has had great wrong.

**Third Plebeian**
Has he, masters?
I fear there will a worse come in his place.

**Fourth Plebeian**
Marked you his words? He would not take the crown; Therefore 'tis certain he was not ambitious.

**First Plebeian**
If it be found so, some will dear abide it.

**Second Plebeian**
Poor soul, his eyes are red as fire with weeping.

**Third Plebeian**
There's not a nobler man in Rome than Antony.

**Fourth Plebeian**
Now mark him, he begins again to speak.

**Antony**
But yesterday the word of Caesar might Have stood against the world. Now lies he there, And none so poor to do him reverence.

O masters, if I were disposed to stir Your hearts and minds to mutiny and rage, I should do Brutus wrong, and Cassius wrong. Who, you all know, are honorable men. I will not do them wrong; I rather choose To wrong the dead, to wrong myself and you, Than I will wrong such honorable men. But here's a parchment with the seal of Caesar. I found it in his closet; 'tis his will. Let but the commons hear this testament— Which, pardon me, I do not mean to read— And they would go and kiss dead Caesar's wounds And dip their napkins in his sacred blood,
Yea, beg a hair of him for memory,
And, dying, mention it within their wills,
Bequeathing it as a rich legacy
Unto their issue\(^2\).

**Fourth Plebeian**
We’ll hear the will! Read it, Mark Antony.

**All**
The will, the will! We will hear Caesar’s will.

**Antony**
Have patience, gentle friends; I must not read it.
It is not meet you know how Caesar loved you.
You are not wood, you are not stones, but men;
And, being men, hearing the will of Caesar,
It will inflame you, it will make you mad.
’Tis good you know not that you are his heirs,
For if you should, O, what would come of it?

**Fourth Plebeian**
Read the will! We’ll hear it, Antony.
You shall read us the will, Caesar’s will.

**Antony**
Will you be patient? Will you stay awhile?
I have o’ershot myself to tell you of it.
I fear I wrong the honorable men
Whose daggers have stabbed Caesar. I do fear it.

**Fourth Plebeian**
They were traitors. “Honorable men!”

**All**
The will! The testament!

**Second Plebeian**
They were villains, murderers. The will! Read the will!

**Antony**
You will compel me, then, to read the will?
Then make a ring about the corpse of Caesar,
And let me show you him that made the will.
Shall I descend? And will you give me leave?

\(^2\) issue: offspring
Several Plebeians
Come down.

Second Plebeian
Descend.

Third Plebeian
You shall have leave.

[Antony descends.]

Fourth Plebeian
A ring; stand round.

First Plebeian
Stand from the hearse. Stand from the body.

Second Plebeian
Room for Antony, most noble Antony.

Antony
Nay, press not so upon me. Stand far off.

Several Plebeians
Stand back! Bear back!

Antony
If you have tears, prepare to shed them now.
You all do know this mantle. I remember
The first time ever Caesar put it on;
’Twas on a summer’s evening, in his tent,
That day he overcame the Nervii.
Look, in this place ran Cassius’ dagger through.
See what a rent the envious Casca made.
Through this the well-beloved Brutus stabbed,
And as he plucked his cursed steel away,
Mark how the blood of Caesar followed it,
As rushing out of doors to be resolved
If Brutus so unkindly knocked or no;
For Brutus, as you know, was Caesar’s angel.

Judge, O you gods, how dearly Caesar loved him!
This was the most unkindest cut of all.
For when the noble Caesar saw him stab,
Ingratitude, more strong than traitors’ arms,
Quite vanquished him. Then burst his mighty heart,
And in his mantle muffling up his face,
Even at the base of Pompey’s statue,
Which all the while ran blood, great Caesar fell.
O, what a fall was there, my countrymen!
Then I, and you, and all of us fell down,
Whilst bloody treason flourished over us.
O, now you weep, and I perceive you feel
The dint of pity. These are gracious drops.
Kind souls, what weep you when you but behold
Our Caesar’s vesture\(^3\) wounded? Look you here,
Here is himself, marr’d, as you see, with traitors.

[Antony lifts Caesar’s cloak.]

First Plebeian
O piteous spectacle!

\(^3\) vesture: clothing
Reread the text to find Antony’s reasons that the murder of Caesar was unjust. Then, identify and explain the persuasive techniques or appeals Antony uses with each reason. An example is provided below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons that Murder was Unjust</th>
<th>Identify as Logos, Pathos, or Ethos and Explain Your Choice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“He hath brought many captives home to Rome, Whose ransoms did the general coffers fill.” This example tries to prove that Caesar could not have been too ambitious if he brought all this wealth to Rome, not to himself.</td>
<td>This technique is an example of logos because it is offering logical supporting examples. It is one of three or four pieces of evidence that Antony provides to prove that Caesar was not ambitious.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Which of the arguments above seems the most persuasive for the audience? Which do you think is the strongest? Was ethos, pathos, or logos the most effective here? Why?

**Literary Terms**

An argument presents a particular opinion or idea and supports it with evidence.

Generate or revise a response to this essential question: “How does one construct a persuasive argument?”
As you read the articles on the next few pages, take notes about the issues related to clothing.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>“Comment” by Pat Lancaster</th>
<th>“Germany Divided Over Hijab” by Andreas Tzortzis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thesis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Support</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persuasive Appeals</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genre Features</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture and Justice</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In “An Immodest Idea,” Jamin Raskin says that an issue like banning religious garb would never happen in U.S. schools. Which Principle of the Declaration of the Rights of the Child (Activity 4.5) protects students from religious discrimination? How does Nashala Hearn’s situation fit in with these ideas?

Brainstorm issues related to dress that are relevant in your school and/or your community. At this point, it does not matter whether you are in favor of or are opposed to the issue.

Draft a working thesis regarding an issue related to dress.

**Reflection** Reflect on your progress toward your goals of improving speaking and listening in small group situations. Refine your goals as needed.
Across this country last month, from Boston to Honolulu, newspaper editorials came to the defense of head scarves for Muslim women in France. The outcry was prompted by French President Jacques Chirac’s call for a ban on the hijab worn by Muslim girls attending public schools. While that might be controversial enough, the measure also would prohibit other “ostentatious” displays of religious allegiance at schools, including yarmulkes and large crosses. “Boy,” the Honolulu Advertiser noted, “could this head-scarf ban backfire.”

The issue has historical roots, but reflects the very contemporary tensions between protecting religious freedom and concern in France that extremism may be growing among the nation’s estimated 5 million Muslims. At the heart of the French debate is the country’s struggle a century ago to break free of the strong hold of the Roman Catholic Church. Chirac portrays the Muslim practice of wearing a head scarf as challenging the politically sacred separation of church and state. Former French Education Minister Bernard Stasi is more emphatic, asserting the ban is intended to counter “forces that are trying to destabilize the country.”

By choice or by pressure. Muslims now make up nearly 8 percent of France’s population, the largest Muslim community in Western Europe. Only about 2,000 French girls, by government estimate, wear head scarves to school, many out of religious conviction. But family pressure and gang rapes of women considered “immodest” in the housing projects of Paris where many recent Muslim immigrants live play a role, as well, concluded the commission that recommended the ban.

Elsewhere in Europe, too, the hijab debate is in the news. The German supreme court in September ruled that the 1998 dismissal of a teacher who refused to remove her head scarf was illegal and would remain so—unless Germany’s 16 states created their own laws against head scarves. Seven of these states have announced plans to do just that.

This clothing conundrum wouldn’t happen in American public schools, says American University constitutional law scholar Jamin Raskin, author of We the Students: Supreme Court Cases for and About Students. “If your veil or yarmulke isn’t preventing anyone from learning, then of course you have the right to wear it,” he says. John Hanford, the U.S. ambassador at large for religious freedom, has come out against the ban, prompting mutterings among French politicos that they wouldn’t dream of weighing in on an American domestic issue, such as whether the Pledge of Allegiance should include the phrase “under God”—a topic that the U.S. Supreme Court is slated to tackle this year.

---

1 yarmulke: skullcap worn by Jewish men and boys
2 conundrum: dilemma, problem
French government threats to impose a ban on the wearing of the Islamic headscarf, or hijab, in schools has created fury in sections of the country's Muslim community. Demonstrations on the streets of several French cities in January served to confirm that the ban on “overt displays of religious paraphernalia,” will extend to the wearing of Jewish skullcaps and large Christian crosses, will only serve to exacerbate racial tension in the country.

The demonstrations were largest in Paris, where thousands took to the streets in protest. Meanwhile, Muslims in London, Berlin and Baghdad came out in solidarity.

The centre-right government of France has taken a hard line against those opposing the proposed legislation, insisting the country must uphold the republican values enshrined in the 1789 revolution and preserve its secular identity. In a speech recommending the ban should become law, President Jacques Chirac warned that if France chooses to capitulate to the will of its religious communities “it would lose its soul.”

However, this is by no means a one sided debate, while some who profess to have no religious beliefs are outraged at what they see as a serious threat to the infringement of civil liberty, others, including Dalil Boubaker, head of the leading Paris mosque and president of the officially sanctioned umbrella organisation of Muslim groups in France, supports the ban and has attempted to discourage Muslims from participating. ‘We absolutely do not want confrontation,” he said.

Many French feminists, including prominent Muslim women, also support the ban, arguing that the hijab is a patriarchal symbol, imposed on Muslim women by male family members. In any event, the Koranic verse which discusses veiling is, they argue, open to interpretation.

For some the feminist argument is a persuasive one. Historically, female emancipation has been closely linked with dress, fashion, and the casting off of restrictive garments such as long skirts, hats, gloves and shape altering undergarments. However, we should not be seduced into believing that a law

1 emancipation: freedom from control of another
which forces Muslim women into removing the hijab is a feminist law. Let them discard it if they choose to do so but let that choice be a personal one.

Many French people genuinely believe the hijab issue is one of liberal principle, namely that of preserving the secular nature of the state education system. In reality the proposed ban plays right into the hands of extremist national parties that have found favour in the Republic in recent years. Jews and Muslims have been the chief targets of these racial attacks; synagogues have been burned and mosques attacked and defaced.

A further escalation of anti-Muslim violence was assumed the day after the hijab street demonstrations when a bomb destroyed the car belonging to a recently appointed government official born in Algeria. Aissa Dermouche, aged 57, had been named as prefect — or top state representative — of the Jura region in early January. Dermouche is the first Muslim for decades to reach the elite ranks of the prefects and his appointment attracted much discussion. The veteran leader of the xenophobic National Front, Jean-Marie Le Pen, described it as a step towards “positive discrimination” towards immigrants. François Fillon, the Minister of Social Affairs condemned the car bomb, in which mercifully no one was hurt, as “the odious act” of someone wishing to “impede” racial and religious integration in France.

So is this about headscarves? Yes, and much more; it is also about the need to uphold personal freedoms, the necessity for dialogue, compromise and the nurturing of mutual respect between France’s white, Christian majority, its five million strong Muslim population and all the other ethnic groups that contribute to its development and success as a leading European power. It is also about liberty, egality and fraternity, for without those three vital principles where would France be today?

2 xenophobic: fearful of foreigners
3 egality: equality
BERLIN – Having spent the last 15 years of her life wearing the Muslim hijab, or head scarf, teacher Emine Öztürk can’t imagine taking it off in public, even for just one minute.

But that’s exactly what Ms. Öztürk might have to do if she ever wants to get a teaching job in a Berlin public school.

“It’s part of my identity,” says this young German of Turkish descent. “How can I lay my identity at the door of the classroom?”

It is a question on the minds of many here following a decision by Germany’s highest court, allowing teacher Fereshta Ludin to wear her head scarf in class as long as there are no state laws against it. Since the decision came down two weeks ago, a majority of German states, including Berlin, have announced plans to pass such laws.

In the debate that has ensued, politicians and Muslim leaders have begun to ask some serious questions about the place their religion and identity holds in a Europe rooted in Christianity and Judaism, but with a growing Muslim population.

“You have a new generation of Muslims . . . reasonably educated, fluent in cultures of languages they live in . . . demanding a sort of legitimization; they want it without having to become assimilated,” says Shireen Hunter, the head of the Center for Strategic Studies Islam Program, and editor of “Islam, Europe’s Second Religion.”

In France, the ban on head scarves in everything from schools to ID cards has provoked an outcry in recent years by that country’s increasingly strong Muslim population. In the United Kingdom and Sweden, a more open attitude prevails. Teachers and even female Muslim police officers are allowed to wear their head scarves.
Germany’s relationship to its 3.2 million Muslims is decidedly more fragile.

Touchy issues of integration such as Muslim dress and the ritual slaughter of sheep in accordance with Islamic law have been brought before courts to decide in recent years. Earlier this summer, the constitutional court ruled that a department store could not fire a Muslim woman because she wanted to wear her head scarf during work.

The legal conflicts are symptoms of the German government and Turkish community neglecting to address the issue of integration, say historians. By the time integration became a topic, the sons and grandsons of the Turkish guest workers who had arrived in the 1960s had already carved out little Ankaras and Istanbuls in Germany’s major cities.

They built up parallel societies that made the Turkish grocer, corner doener¹ stand, and mosque part of the everyday urban landscape in Germany. Many Muslim leaders are puzzled why a hijab-wearing woman wanting to teach in a public school is such a big deal nowadays.

“We live in a free, modern society, where everyone has their own self-awareness,” says Ali Kizilkaya, head of the powerful and controversial Islamrat, Germany’s largest Muslim group. “Are we so weak that a square foot of cloth can make us feel threatened?”

Opponents argue that it is not the head scarf, but the fact that Ludin wants to wear it in a public school classroom. Germany has no official religion, and the state is constitutionally bound to maintain a position of neutrality in religious matters.

Eight years ago, the constitutional court ruled that crucifixes would have to be removed from classrooms in Bavaria if just one student objected.

Some observers see the push to wear the Muslim head scarf in a school setting as incompatible with this principle of state neutrality. The fact that Muslims want what many see as more freedom to express their religion than German Christians makes parliamentarian Wolfgang Bosbach angry.

“The debate is absurd,” says the domestic affairs expert for the conservative Christian Democrats in the German parliament. “This is not an Islamic country, it’s a Christian country, and we should not be forced to accommodate Islam.”

Other Germans perceive the scarf as a threat not so much to a Judeo-Christian heritage, but to Western secularism² and women’s rights.

---

¹ doener: a Turkish dish sold by street vendors
² secularism: separation of church and civil concerns
“There are very few women who wear the head scarf voluntarily, and their number is so small they are not worth talking about,” says Seyran Ates, a women’s right activist and lawyer in Berlin.

Since running away from her parents’ traditional Turkish household in Berlin at 18, Ms. Ates has spent her life fighting for the rights of women yearning to break free of the traditional and religious mold their parents foresee for them.

In the two weeks since the decision came down, she has been a favorite of TV news producers looking for the choice sound bite. The 40-year-old, who wrote a book about leaving her strict home, says she is astounded at the legitimacy with which some German politicians give the head scarf.

“We need to never forget that what we’re talking about here is fundamentalism,” she says.

Rather than decide what place a piece of cloth that represents religious freedom to some, fundamentalism to others, has in a state-run school, Germany’s constitutional court referred the question to the state parliaments and the public domain—where many believe it belongs.

“We’re not ready for such a decision,” says Riem Spielhaus, an Islamic Studies professor at Berlin’s Humboldt University. Referring to Germany’s integration problems, Professor Spielhaus says, “We need an atmosphere of openness where we can admit that other religions might also change our values.”

The direction the debate is going worries both Muslims and Germans. Misconceptions that the head scarf is an umbilical cord to a fundamentalist Islam could have the opposite effect. Pockets of devout Muslims, facing limited job prospects because of their religious dress, could withdraw into parallel societies harboring the type of terror nests that produced the Sept. 11 attackers.

“There’s not a fundamentalist under every head scarf, and thinking that would be fatal,” says Spielhaus. “Ms. Ludin’s head scarf, which she willingly puts on, is good for the Western society. Banning head scarves would be a victory for fundamentalists.”

Öztürk makes a similar argument, adding that her head scarf could even begin dismantling prejudices before they arise in her young students.

“I think it’s very sad that this society continues to look at the head scarf as something of a threat,” said Öztürk. “I find it shocking that so many things are projected onto the head scarf without anyone ever asking the women who wear them.”

---

3 fundamentalism: a point of view characterized by a rigid adherence to fundamental principles; often intolerant of other views
On March 30, the U.S. Justice Department filed a complaint against the Muskogee Public School District in Muskogee, Oklahoma. The trouble: The Justice Department says the way the district uses its dress-code policy violates the U.S. Constitution.

Last fall, school officials twice suspended sixth-grader Nashala Hearn. They said her head scarf violated the dress code, which prohibits hats and other head coverings.

Nashala, 11, wears the head scarf, called a hijab, as part of her Muslim religious beliefs. Nashala’s family is suing the school district, saying that its dress code discriminates unfairly against religious clothing. The Justice Department agrees and wants the school to change its policy.

“No student should be forced to choose between following her faith and enjoying the benefits of a public education,” says Assistant Attorney General R. Alexander Acosta.
Thank you Senator Cornyn. It is an honor to be here. And thank you Senator Feingold, too.

My name is Nashala Hearn. I am 12 years old and I live in Muskogee, Oklahoma with my father—who is here with me today—and my mother, and my brother and my sister. I attend the Benjamin Franklin Science Academy, which is a public middle school in my home town.
On October 1st, 2003 I was suspended for 3 days from the Muskogee Public Schools for wearing my hijab – which is a headscarf required by religion—Islam.

I didn’t know it was going to be a problem because on August 18, 2003 – my first day of school last year—I explained to my homeroom teacher that I am Muslim and I wear a hijab—and that I also pray between 1:00 and 1:30. She said that was fine and that she had a room for me to pray in.

From that day forward—I received compliments from other kids as well as school officials.

But my problems started on September 11, 2003. I was in the breakfast line when my teacher came up to me and said that after I was done eating to call my parents because my hijab looks like a bandanna or a handkerchief and that I was not allowed to wear it.

So after I was finished, I went to the office.

Mrs. Walker had already called my parents. When my parents got there they were very upset. The principal said it was a bandana and I had to change it or go home.

And this is how the battle of being obedient to God by wearing my hijab to be modest in Islam versus the school dress code policy began.

I continued to wear my hijab—because it would be against my religion not to.

So—like I said before, I was suspended from school on October 1st for 3 days. When I came back to school on October 7th—I was suspended again. This time it was for 5 days.
I was not able to go back to school after that until the problem was fixed.

This experience has been very stressful, very depressing and humiliating.

But thanks to the Department of Justice, the Rutherford Institute and my lawyer, Mrs. Leah Farish, the problem no longer exists in the Muskogee Public Schools. The school agreed to let me and other kids wear our religious clothing.

Thank you for listening and thank you very much for having me here today!
Fill in the KWL chart below with ideas about civil disobedience.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What I Know</th>
<th>What I Want to Know</th>
<th>What I Learned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
About the Author

Born in 1869, Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi was a great believer in the power of using civil disobedience against governments that oppressed the poor and the disenfranchised. He spent seven years in South Africa leading and defending Indians born and living there without legal rights. It was there that he began practicing satyagraha, or passive resistance. Later, he returned to his homeland of India where he helped the country gain its independence from the British in 1947. He became known there as Mahatma, or “Great Soul.” India, though free from Britain, suffered from internal turmoil as religious factions fought for power. Gandhi was assassinated by a fanatic in 1948.

As you read “On Civil Disobedience,” consider how Gandhi might advise you to respond to an unjust law.

Excerpt from

“On Civil Disobedience”

by Mohandas K. Gandhi

JULY 27, 1916

There are two ways of countering injustice. One way is to smash the head of the man who perpetrates injustice and to get your own head smashed in the process. All strong people in the world adopt this course. Everywhere wars are fought and millions of people are killed. The consequence is not the progress of a nation but its decline. . . . No country has ever become, or will ever become, happy through victory in war. A nation does not rise that way;
it only falls further. In fact, what comes to it is defeat, not victory. And if, perchance, either our act or our purpose was ill-conceived, it brings disaster to both belligerents.

But through the other method of combating injustice, we alone suffer the consequences of our mistakes, and the other side is wholly spared. This other method is satyagraha. One who resorts to it does not have to break another’s head; he may merely have his own head broken. He has to be prepared to die himself suffering all the pain. In opposing the atrocious laws of the Government of South Africa, it was this method that we adopted. We made it clear to the said Government that we would never bow to its outrageous laws. No clapping is possible without two hands to do it, and no quarrel without two persons to make it. Similarly, no State is possible without two entities, the rulers and the ruled. You are our sovereign, our Government, only so long as we consider ourselves your subjects. When we are not subjects, you are not the sovereign either. So long as it is your endeavour to control us with justice and love, we will let you to do so. But if you wish to strike at us from behind, we cannot permit it. Whatever you do in other matters, you will have to ask our opinion about the laws that concern us. If you make laws to keep us suppressed in a wrongful manner and without taking us into confidence, these laws will merely adorn the statute books. We will never obey them. Award us for it what punishment you like; we will put up with it. Send us to prison and we will live there as in a paradise. Ask us to mount the scaffold and we will do so laughing. Shower what sufferings you like upon us; we will calmly endure all and not hurt a hair of your body. We will gladly die and will not so much as touch you. But so long as there is yet life in these our bones, we will never comply with your arbitrary laws.

Discussion Group:
On separate paper, create a graphic organizer that illustrates Gandhi’s argument.

Who is Gandhi’s audience? What in the text tells you this?

1. belligerents: participants in a war
2. satyagraha: (Sanskrit) insistence on truth—a term used by Gandhi to describe his policy of seeking reform by means of nonviolent resistance
3. statute books: books of law
4. scaffold: a platform on which people are executed by hanging
5. arbitrary: illogical, unreasonable

Belligerents contains the root -bell-, from the Latin word bellum, meaning “war.” This root also appears in bellicose, ante bellum, and rebellion.

Suppressed contains the root -press-, from the Latin word premere, meaning “to press.” This root also appears in repress, impress, impression, and pressure.

An audience is the reader, listener, or viewer of a particular piece of writing, speaking, or visual.
Civil Disobedience

Speech

About the Author
Martin Luther King, Jr. (1929–1968) is considered the most important voice of the Civil Rights Movement in the United States. Under King’s leadership, African Americans gathered forces to overcome the legalized racism of segregation in the South. King enjoined communities to participate in nonviolent acts of resistance. In 1963, King and many others were sent to jail for peacefully demonstrating in Birmingham, Alabama. While in jail, King wrote a letter in which he articulated his ideas about civil disobedience and nonviolent resistance. Soon after, King and a crowd of 200,000 participated in the historic March on Washington, D.C., where King gave perhaps his most famous speech, “I Have a Dream.” King was assassinated at age 39.

Dr. King also advocated civil disobedience. Annotate “Letter from Birmingham Jail” as your teacher directs a guided reading.

Excerpt from
Letter from Birmingham Jail

Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr.

April 17, 1963

My Dear Fellow Clergymen:

While confined here in the Birmingham city jail, I came across your recent statement calling my present activities “unwise and untimely.” Seldom do I pause to answer criticisms of my work and ideas. If I sought to answer all the criticism that cross my desk, my secretaries would have little time for anything other than such correspondence in the course of the day, and I would have no time for constructive work. But since I feel that you are men of genuine goodwill and that your criticisms are sincerely set forth, I want to try to answer your statement in what I hope will be patient and reasonable terms.

I think I should indicate why I am here in Birmingham, since you have been influenced by the view which argues against “outsiders coming in.” I have the honor of serving as president of the Southern Christian Leadership Conference, an organization operating in every Southern state, with headquarters in Atlanta, Georgia. We have some eighty-five affiliated organizations across the South, and one of them is the Alabama Christian Movement for Human Rights. Frequently we share staff,
educational, and financial resources with our affiliates. Several months ago the affiliate here in Birmingham asked us to be on call to engage in a nonviolent direct-action program if such were deemed necessary. We readily consented, and when the hour came, we lived up to our promise. So I, along with several members of my staff, am here because I was invited here. I am here because I have organizational ties here.

But more basically, I am in Birmingham because injustice is here. Just as the prophets of the eighth century B.C. left their villages and carried their “thus saith the Lord” far beyond the boundaries of their hometowns, and just as the Apostle Paul left his village of Tarsus and carried the gospel of Jesus Christ to the far corners of the Greco-Roman world, so am I compelled to carry the gospel of freedom beyond my own hometown. Like Paul, I must constantly respond to the Macedonian call for aid.

Moreover, I am cognizant of the interrelatedness of all communities and states. I cannot sit idly by in Atlanta and not be concerned about what happens in Birmingham. Injustice anywhere is a threat to justice everywhere. We are caught in an inescapable network of mutuality, tied in a single garment of destiny. Whatever affects one directly, affects all indirectly. Never again can we afford to live with the narrow, provincial “outside agitator” idea. Anyone who lives inside the United States can never be considered an outsider anywhere within its bounds.

You deplore the demonstrations taking place in Birmingham. But your statement, I am sorry to say, fails to express a similar concern for the conditions that brought about the demonstrations. I am sure that none of you would want to rest content with the superficial kind of social analysis that deals merely with effects and does not grapple with underlying causes. It is unfortunate that demonstrations are taking place in Birmingham, but it is even more unfortunate that the city’s white power structure left the Negro community with no alternative. . . .

You may well ask: “Why direct action? Why sit-ins, marches, and so forth? Isn’t negotiation a better path?” You are quite right in calling for negotiation. Indeed, this is the very purpose of direct action. Nonviolent direct action seeks to create such a crisis and foster such a tension that a community which has constantly refused to negotiate is forced to confront the issue. It seeks so to dramatize the issue that it can no longer be ignored. My citing the creation of tension as part of the work of the nonviolent-resister may sound rather shocking. But I must confess that I am not afraid of the word “tension.” I have earnestly opposed violent tension, but there is a type of constructive, nonviolent tension which is necessary for growth. Just as Socrates felt that it was necessary to create a tension in the mind so that individuals could rise from the bondage of myths and halftruths to the unfettered realm of creative analysis and objective appraisal, so must we see the need for nonviolent gadflies\(^1\) to create the kind of tension in society that will help men rise from the dark depths of prejudice and racism to the majestic heights of understanding and brotherhood.

\(^1\) gadflies: pests
The purpose of our direct-action program is to create a situation so crisis-packed that it will inevitably open the door to negotiation. I therefore concur with you in your call for negotiation. Too long has our beloved Southland been bogged down in a tragic effort to live in monologue rather than dialogue. . . .

You express a great deal of anxiety over our willingness to break laws. This is certainly a legitimate concern. Since we so diligently urge people to obey the Supreme Court’s decision of 1954 outlawing segregation in the public schools, at first glance it may seem rather paradoxical for us consciously to break laws. One may ask: “How can you advocate breaking some laws and obeying others?” The answer lies in the fact that there are two types of laws: just and unjust. I would be the first to advocate obeying just laws. Conversely, one has a moral responsibility to disobey unjust laws. I would agree with St. Augustine that “an unjust law is no law at all.”

Now, what is the difference between the two? How does one determine whether a law is just or unjust? A just law is a man-made code that squares with the moral law or the law of God. An unjust law is a code that is out of harmony with the moral law. To put it in the terms of St. Thomas Aquinas: An unjust law is a human law that is not rooted in eternal law and natural law. Any law that uplifts human personality is just. Any law that degrades human personality is unjust. All segregation statutes are unjust because segregation distorts the soul and damages the personality. It gives the segregator a false sense of superiority and the segregated a false sense of inferiority. Segregation, to use the terminology of the Jewish philosopher Martin Buber, substitutes an “I-it” relationship for an “I-thou” relationship and ends up relegating persons to the status of things. Hence segregation is not only politically, economically and sociologically unsound, it is morally wrong and sinful. Paul Tillich has said that sin is separation. Is not segregation an existential expression of man’s tragic separation, his awful estrangement, his terrible sinfulness? Thus is it that I can urge men to obey the 1954 decision of the Supreme Court, for it is morally right; and I can urge them to disobey segregation ordinances, for they are morally wrong.

Let us consider a more concrete example of just and unjust laws. An unjust law is a code that a numerical or power majority group compels a minority group to obey but does not make binding on itself. This is difference made legal. By the same token, a just law is a code that a majority compels a minority to follow and that it is willing to follow itself. This is sameness made legal.

Let me give another explanation. A law is unjust if it is inflicted on a minority that, as a result of being denied the right to vote, had no part in

2 1954 decision of the Supreme Court: Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka, which stated that racially separated schools were unequal and violated the 14th Amendment of the U.S. Constitution
3 paradoxical: self-contradictory
4 St. Augustine, St. Thomas Aquinas, Martin Buber, Paul Tillich: theologians
enacting or devising the law. Who can say that the legislature of Alabama which set up that state’s segregation laws was democratically elected? Throughout Alabama all sorts of devious methods are used to prevent Negroes from becoming registered voters, and there are some counties in which, even though Negroes constitute a majority of the population, not a single Negro is registered. Can any law enacted under such circumstances be considered democratically structured?

Sometimes a law is just on its face and unjust in its application. For instance, I have been arrested on a charge of parading without a permit. Now, there is nothing wrong in having an ordinance which requires a permit for a parade. But such an ordinance becomes unjust when it is used to maintain segregation and to deny citizens the First-Amendment privilege of peaceful assembly and protest.

I hope you are able to see the distinction I am trying to point out. In no sense do I advocate evading or defying the law, as would the rabid segregationist. That would lead to anarchy. One who breaks an unjust law must do so openly, lovingly, and with a willingness to accept the penalty. I submit that an individual who breaks a law that conscience tells him is unjust, and who willingly accepts the penalty of imprisonment in order to arouse the conscience of the community over its injustice, is in reality expressing the highest respect for law.

Of course, there is nothing new about this kind of civil disobedience. It was evidenced sublimely in the refusal of Shadrach, Meshach, and Abednego to obey the laws of Nebuchadnezzar, on the ground that a higher moral law was at stake. It was practiced superbly by the early Christians, who were willing to face hungry lions and the excruciating pain of chopping blocks rather than submit to certain unjust laws of the Roman Empire. To a degree, academic freedom is a reality today because Socrates practiced civil disobedience. In our own nation, the Boston Tea Party represented a massive act of civil disobedience.

We should never forget that everything Adolf Hitler did in Germany was “legal” and everything the Hungarian freedom fighters did in Hungary was “illegal.” It was “illegal” to aid and comfort a Jew in Hitler’s Germany. Even so, I am sure that, had I lived in Germany at the time, I would have aided and comforted my Jewish brothers. If today I lived in a Communist country where certain principles dear to the Christian faith are suppressed, I would openly advocate disobeying that country’s anti-religious laws. . . .

Oppressed people cannot remain oppressed forever. The yearning for freedom eventually manifests itself, and that is what has happened to the American Negro. Something within has reminded him of his birthright of

5 Shadrach, Meshach, and Abednego; Nebuchadnezzar: In the Bible (Daniel), King Nebuchadnezzar of Babylon required citizens to worship an idol. Shadrach, Meshach, and Abednego refused, accepting the punishment of a fiery furnace. They were miraculously saved, unharmed by the fire.

6 Hungarian freedom fighters demanded democracy for Hungary but were defeated in a Soviet attack in 1956.
freedom, and something without has reminded him that it can be gained. Consciously or unconsciously, he has been caught up by the Zeitgeist, and with his black brothers of Africa and his brown and yellow brothers of Asia, South America, and the Caribbean, the United States Negro is moving with a sense of great urgency toward the promised land of racial justice. If one recognizes this vital urge that has engulfed the Negro community, one should readily understand why public demonstrations are taking place. The Negro has many pent-up resentments and latent frustrations, and he must release them. So let him march; let him make prayer pilgrimages to the city hall; let him go on freedom rides — and try to understand why he must do so. If his repressed emotions are not released in nonviolent ways, they will seek expression through violence; this is not a threat but a fact of history. So I have not said to my people, “Get rid of your discontent.” Rather, I have tried to say that this normal and healthy discontent can be channeled into the creative outlet of nonviolent direct action. And now this approach is being termed extremist.

But though I was initially disappointed at being categorized as an extremist, as I continued to think about the matter I gradually gained a measure of satisfaction from the label. Was not Jesus an extremist for love: “Love your enemies, bless them that curse you, do good to them that hate you, and pray for them which despitefully use you, and persecute you.” Was not Amos an extremist for justice: “Let justice roll down like waters and righteousness like an ever-flowing stream.” Was not Paul an extremist for the Christian gospel: “I bear in my body the marks of the Lord Jesus.” Was not Martin Luther an extremist: “Here I stand; I cannot do otherwise, so help me God.” And John Bunyan: “I will stay in jail to the end of my days before I make a butchery of my conscience.” And Abraham Lincoln: “This nation cannot survive half slave and half free.” And Thomas Jefferson: “We hold these truths to be self-evident, that all men are created equal . . . .” So the question is not whether we will be extremists, but what kind of extremists we will be. Will we be extremists for hate or for love? Will we be extremists for the preservation of injustice or for the extension of justice? In that dramatic scene on Cavalry’s hill three men were crucified. We must never forget that all three were crucified for the same crime — the crime of extremism. Two were extremists for immorality, and thus fell below their environment. The other, Jesus Christ, was an extremist for love, truth, and goodness, and thereby rose above his environment. Perhaps the South, the nation, and the world are in dire need of creative extremists. . . . I wish you had commended the Negro sit-inners and demonstrators of Birmingham for their sublime courage, their willingness to suffer, and their amazing discipline in the midst of great provocation. One day the South will recognize its real heroes. They will be the James Merediths, with the noble sense of purpose that enables them to face jeering and hostile mobs, and with the agonizing loneliness
that characterizes the life of the pioneer. They will be old, oppressed, battered Negro women, symbolized in a seventy-two-year-old woman in Montgomery, Alabama, who rose up with a sense of dignity and when her people decided not to ride segregated buses, and who responded with ungrammatical profundity to one who inquired about her weariness: “My feets is tired, but my soul is at rest.” They will be the young high school and college students, the young ministers of the gospel and a host of their elders, courageously and nonviolently sitting in at lunch counters and willingly going to jail for conscience’ sake. One day the South will know that when these disinherited children of God sat down at lunch counters, they were in reality standing up for what is best in the American dream and for the most sacred values in our Judaeo-Christian heritage, thereby bringing our nation back to those great wells of democracy which were dug deep by the founding fathers in their formulation of the Constitution and the Declaration of Independence.

Never before have I written so long a letter. I’m afraid it is much too long to take your precious time. I can assure you that it would have been much shorter if I had been writing from a comfortable desk, but what else can one do when he is alone in a narrow jail cell, other than write long letters, think long thoughts, and pray long prayers?

If I have said anything in this letter that overstates the truth and indicates an unreasonable impatience, I beg you to forgive me. If I have said anything that understates the truth and indicates my having a patience that allows me to settle for anything less than brotherhood, I beg God to forgive me.

I hope this letter finds you strong in the faith. I also hope that circumstances will soon make it possible for me to meet each of you, not as an integrationist or a civil-rights leader but as a fellow clergyman and a Christian brother. Let us all hope that the dark clouds of racial prejudice will soon pass away and the deep fog of misunderstanding will be lifted from our fear-drenched communities, and in some not too distant tomorrow the radiant stars of love and brotherhood will shine over our great nation with all their scintillating beauty.

Yours for the cause of Peace and Brotherhood, Martin Luther King, Jr.

After reading the letter, analyze how Dr. King uses his knowledge of his audience to shape a persuasive argument.

Taking into consideration the reading, writing, thinking, and discussing that you have done in the unit so far, reflect on your growing understanding of the essential questions in this unit:

- What is the nature of justice?
- How does one construct a persuasive argument?
Activity 4.9

Justice and Moral Reasoning

SUGGESTED LEARNING STRATEGIES: Diffusing, Graphic Organizer, Discussion Groups, Visualizing

Survey: How Just Are You?

Circle only one choice in each of the following:

1. I should not exceed the speed limit on the highway because
   a. I will get a ticket that will cost me a lot of money and time at court.
   b. it is the law, and laws need to be followed.
   c. I am concerned about everyone else on the highway and their right to be safe and free from danger.

2. I should not cheat on my geometry test because
   a. I will get an “F” if I get caught.
   b. my teacher and my parents will think I’m a bad person if I get caught.
   c. I will hurt others through my actions by lowering the standards of student behavior whether I am caught or not.

3. I should not smoke in the school bathroom because
   a. there’s not enough ventilation and I might make myself sick.
   b. the principal said it is against school rules.
   c. others might come in after me, breathe in the smoke, and become ill.

4. I should pay all my taxes because
   a. I could go to jail if I did not.
   b. people will think of me as a good citizen.
   c. my taxes, along with those of others, will help to pay for services used by all.

Total #a ________  Total # b ________  Total # c ________

If you have mainly “a” responses, you are at the preconventional level. What might people who make decisions at the preconventional level be like?

If you have mainly “b” responses, you are at the conventional level. What might people who make decisions at the post-conventional level be like?

If you have mainly “c” responses, you are at the post-conventional level. What might people who make decisions at the post-conventional level be like?

Which level are you? Do you think that the description fits you? Explain.
Kohlberg’s Six Stages of Moral Reasoning

Lawrence Kohlberg (1927–1987) was a teacher of education and social psychology at two American universities, the University Chicago and Harvard University. In 1981, he published The Philosophy of Moral Development, a definitive study on the how a child’s conscience and moral awareness develops. The text that follows explains Kohlberg’s studies and the theories he developed to describe the stages people go through as they develop moral reasoning.

In the late 1950s, Lawrence Kohlberg began to collect data related to moral questions. Kohlberg had studied Jean Piaget’s earlier work in cognitive and moral development and used this as a foundation for a 15-year study of moral reasoning. Piaget’s work focused primarily on uncovering cognitive stages. Kohlberg’s study also focused on a developmental sequence of stages and revealed that individuals restructure their thinking about social and moral questions just as they develop their cognitive structure from the very concrete toward the more abstract.

Specifically, Kohlberg introduced a developmental theory for moral reasoning. The theory presents six stages of moral reasoning:

I. PRECONVENTIONAL LEVEL

At this level the child is responsive to cultural rules and labels of good and bad, right and wrong, but interprets these labels in terms of either the physical or the hedonistic consequences of action (punishment, reward, exchange of favors) or in terms of the physical power of those who enunciate the rules and labels. The level is divided into two stages:

---

1 As most clearly reflected in thinking, cognition means putting things together, relating events. In cognitive theories, such relating is assumed to be an active connecting process, not a passive connection of events through external association and repetition (Kohlberg, “The Concepts of Developmental Psychology as the Central Guide to Education,” Proceedings of the Conference on Psychology and the Process of Schooling in the Next Decade [Washington: U.S.O.E., 1973], p. 4.)

Stage 1: The punishment and obedience orientation. The physical consequences of action determine its goodness or badness regardless of the human meaning or value of these consequences. Avoidance of punishment and unquestioning deference to power are valued in their own right, not in terms of respect for an underlying moral order supported by punishment and authority (the latter being Stage 4).

Stage 2: The instrumental relativist orientation. Right action consists of that which instrumentally satisfies one’s own needs and occasionally the needs of others. Human relations are viewed in terms like those of the market place. Elements of fairness, reciprocity, and equal sharing are present, but they are always interpreted in a physical or pragmatic way.

Reciprocity is a matter of “you scratch my back and I’ll scratch yours,” not of loyalty, gratitude, or justice.

II. CONVENTIONAL LEVEL

At this level, maintaining the expectations of the individual’s family, group, or nation is perceived as valuable in its own right, regardless of immediate and obvious consequences. The attitude is not only one of conformity to personal expectations and social order, but of loyalty to it, of actively maintaining, supporting, and justifying the order and of identifying with the persons or group involved in it. At this level, there are two stages:

Stage 3: The interpersonal concordance of “good boy–nice girl” orientation. Good behavior is that which pleases or helps and is approved by others. There is much conformity to stereotypical images of what is majority or natural behavior. Behavior is frequently judged by intention. “He means well” becomes important for the first time. One earns approval by being nice.

Stage 4: The law and order orientation. This is orientation toward authority, fixed rules, and the maintenance of the social order. Right behavior consists of doing one’s duty, showing respect for authority, and maintaining the given social order for its own sake.

III. POST-CONVENTIONAL, AUTONOMOUS, OR PRINCIPLED LEVEL

At this level, there is a clear effort to define moral values and principles which have validity and application apart from the authority of the groups or persons holding these principles and apart from the individual’s own identification with these groups. This level has two stages:

Stage 5: The social-contract legalistic orientation, generally with utilitarian overtones. Right action tends to be defined in terms of general individual rights and in terms of standards which have been critically examined and agreed upon by the whole society. There is a clear awareness of the relativism of personal values and opinions and a corresponding emphasis upon procedural rules for reaching consensus. Aside from what is constitutionally and democratically agreed upon, the right is a matter of personal values.
and opinion. The result is an emphasis upon the legal point of view, but with an emphasis upon the possibility of changing law in terms of rational considerations of social utility (rather than rigidly maintaining it in terms of Stage 4 law and order). Outside the legal realm, free agreement and contract are the binding elements of obligation. This is the official morality of the American government and Constitution.

Stage 6: The universal ethical principle orientation. Right is defined by the decision of conscience in accord with self-chosen ethical principles appealing to logical comprehensiveness, universality, and consistency. These principles are abstract and ethical (the Golden Rule, the categorical imperative) and are not concrete moral rules like the Ten Commandments. At heart, these are universal principles of justice, of the reciprocity and equality of human rights, and of respect for dignity of human beings as individual persons.

The six stages represent a pattern of thinking which integrates each person's experience and perspective on specific moral issues.
After reading about Kohlberg’s three levels of moral development, examine the following fictional scenario.

A man named Heinz had a wife dying from a rare disease. A drug that might save her was available from a druggist in town, but he was charging $200,000, a sum that Heinz could never pay and was ten times what the druggist paid for the drug himself. Heinz borrowed all the money he could and went to the druggist with half the amount needed and asked him to sell the drug cheaper, but the druggist refused.

Heinz became desperate and broke into the druggist’s store one night and stole the drug.

Should Heinz have done that?

How might a person at each level of development respond to Heinz’s situation? Provide a reason for your decisions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Would he have stolen?</th>
<th>Why or why not? (Use a quote from the text to support)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preconventional</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conventional</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-conventional</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What would you have done in this situation? Why? Which level does this represent?

What light do Kohlberg’s levels shed on your understanding of the nature of justice?
Preparation for Socratic Seminar

Would Heinz go to jail if he were caught? Should he? Is he willing to go to jail for his crime?

Martin Luther King, Jr., Mahatma Gandhi, Susan B. Anthony, and many others have gone to jail when they broke laws with which they did not agree. What do you know about their actions or those of others who made similar choices? What types of laws were these individuals willing to break despite the penalty?

Issue to Discuss

When is it acceptable to break a law with which you do not agree?

Generating Questions

Thought-provoking questions keep a Socratic Seminar interesting. Brainstorm some questions that you might bring into the discussion:

Reflection on Seminar

Reflect on two aspects of this seminar. On separate paper, write thoughtfully about what you learned about the nature of justice from this discussion. Next, describe how successful you feel the discussion was. What might you change the next time your class holds a Socratic Seminar?
Protesting Injustice through an Essay

Based on what you have learned about this writer, why do you think injustice would be of particular concern to him?

Your teacher will guide your reading of an essay by Alexandr Solzhenitsyn. Afterwards, visualize and create an artistic depiction of the power of literature over the power of lies.
THINK THAT WORLD LITERATURE has the power in these frightening times to help mankind see itself accurately despite what is advocated by partisans and by parties. It has the power to transmit the condensed experience of one region to another, so that different scales of values are combined, and so that one people accurately and concisely knows the true history of another with a power of recognition and acute awareness as if it had lived through that history itself—and could thus be spared repeating old mistakes. At the same time, perhaps we ourselves may succeed in developing our own WORLD-WIDE VIEW, like any man, with the center of the eye seeing what is nearby but the periphery of vision taking in what is happening in the rest of the world. We will make correlations and maintain world-wide standards.

Who, if not writers, are to condemn their own unsuccessful governments (in some states this is the easiest way to make a living; everyone who is not too lazy does it) as well as society itself, whether for its cowardly humiliation or for its self-satisfied weakness, or the lightheaded escapades of the young, or the youthful pirates brandishing knives?

We will be told: What can literature do against the pitiless onslaught of naked violence? Let us not forget that violence does not and cannot flourish by itself; it is inevitably intertwined with LYING. Between them there is the closest, the most profound and natural bond: nothing screens violence...
except lies, and the only way lies can hold out is by violence. Whoever has once announced violence as his METHOD must inexorably choose lying as his PRINCIPLE. At birth, violence behaves openly and even proudly. But as soon as it becomes stronger and firmly established, it senses the thinning of the air around it and cannot go on without befogging itself in lies, coating itself with lying's sugary oratory. It does not always or necessarily go straight for the gullet; usually it demands of its victims only allegiance to the lie, only complicity in the lie.

The simple act of an ordinary courageous man is not to take part, not to support lies! Let that come into the world and even reign over it, but not through me. Writers and artists can do more: they can VANQUISH LIES! In the struggle against lies, art has always won and always will.

Conspicuously, incontestably for everyone. Lies can stand up against much in the world, but not against art.

Once lies have been dispelled, the repulsive nakedness of violence will be exposed—and hollow violence will collapse.

That, my friend, is why I think we can help the world in its red-hot hour: not by the nay-saying of having no armaments, not by abandoning oneself to the carefree life, but by going into battle!

In Russian, proverbs about TRUTH are favorites. They persistently express the considerable, bitter, grim experience of the people, often astonishingly:

ONE WORD OF TRUTH OUTWEIGHS THE WORLD.

On such a seemingly fantastic violation of the law of the conservation of mass and energy are based both my own activities and my appeal to the writers of the whole world.
**Protesting Injustice through a Painting**

Your teacher will show you a copy of a *Guernica*, a famous painting by Pablo Picasso. As you study Picasso’s *Guernica*, use the OPTIC strategy to help you analyze it.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Overview</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Take a first look at the artwork, noticing the subject.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brainstorm some questions about it.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Parts</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Look closely at the artwork, making note of important elements and details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Title</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pay attention to the title and any captions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Interrelationships</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Look for connections between and among the title, caption, and the parts of the art.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Conclusion</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Form a conclusion about the meaning of the artwork. Remember the questions you asked when you first examined it. Be prepared to support your conclusion with evidence.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Protesting Injustice through a Photo Essay

Use the OPTIC strategy to analyze other visual art forms, such as a photo essay.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Take a first look at the photo essay, noticing the main subjects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brainstorm some questions about the photo essay.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Look closely at the photo essay, making note of important elements and details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notice the audio track, if the photo essay is a multi-media presentation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pay attention to the title and any captions.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interrelationships</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Look for connections between and among the title, captions, and the parts of the graphic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notice the order of the images; what meaning is created by sequencing the images in this way?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How are images juxtaposed for effect?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Form a conclusion about the meaning of the photo essay. Remember the questions you asked when you first examined the visual.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is the photographer’s thesis?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is his support?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What persuasive appeals does he use?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be prepared to support your idea with evidence from the text.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GUERNICA: Testimony of War

It is modern art’s most powerful antiwar statement... created by the twentieth century’s most well-known and least understood artist. But the mural called Guernica is not at all what Pablo Picasso has in mind when he agrees to paint the centerpiece for the Spanish Pavilion of the 1937 World’s Fair.

For three months, Picasso has been searching for inspiration for the mural, but the artist is in a sullen mood, frustrated by a decade of turmoil in his personal life and dissatisfaction with his work. The politics of his native homeland are also troubling him, as a brutal civil war ravages Spain. Republican forces, loyal to the newly elected government, are under attack from a fascist coup led by Generalissimo Francisco Franco. Franco promises prosperity and stability to the people of Spain. Yet he delivers only death and destruction.

Hoping for a bold visual protest to Franco’s treachery from Spain’s most eminent artist, colleagues and representatives of the democratic government have come to Picasso’s home in Paris to ask him to paint the mural. Though his sympathies clearly lie with the new Republic, Picasso generally avoids politics - and disdains overtly political art.

The official theme of the Paris Exposition is a celebration of modern technology. Organizers hope this vision of a bright future will jolt the nations out of the economic depression and social unrest of the thirties.

As plans unfold, much excitement is generated by the Aeronautics Pavilion, featuring the latest advances in aircraft design and engineering. Who would suspect that this dramatic progress would bring about such dire consequences?

On April 27th, 1937, unprecedented atrocities are perpetrated on behalf of Franco against the civilian population of a little Basque village in northern Spain. Chosen for bombing practice by Hitler’s burgeoning war machine, the hamlet is pounded with high-explosive and incendiary bombs for over three hours. Townspeople are cut down as they run from the crumbling buildings. Guernica burns for three days. Sixteen hundred civilians are killed or wounded.

By May 1st, news of the massacre at Guernica reaches Paris, where more than a million protesters flood the streets to voice their outrage in the largest May Day demonstration the city has ever seen. Eyewitness reports fill the front pages of Paris papers. Picasso is stunned by the stark black and white photographs. Appalled and enraged, Picasso rushes through the crowded streets to his studio, where he quickly sketches the first images for the mural he will call Guernica. His search for inspiration is over.

From the beginning, Picasso chooses not to represent the horror of Guernica in realist or romantic terms. Key figures - a woman with outstretched arms, a bull, an agonized horse - are refined in sketch after sketch, then transferred to the capacious canvas, which he also reworks several times. “A painting is not thought out and settled in advance,” said Picasso. “While it is being done, it changes as one’s thoughts change. And when it’s finished, it goes on changing, according to the state of mind of whoever is looking at it.”
Three months later, Guernica is delivered to the Spanish Pavilion, where the Paris Exposition is already in progress. Located out of the way, and grouped with the pavilions of smaller countries some distance from the Eiffel Tower, the Spanish Pavilion stood in the shadow of Albert Speer’s monolith to Nazi Germany. The Spanish Pavilion’s main attraction, Picasso’s Guernica, is a sober reminder of the tragic events in Spain.

Initial reaction to the painting is overwhelmingly critical. The German fair guide calls Guernica “a hodgepodge of body parts that any four-year-old could have painted.” It dismisses the mural as the dream of a madman. Even the Soviets, who had sided with the Spanish government against Franco, react coolly. They favor more overt imagery, believing that only more realistic art can have political or social consequence. Yet Picasso’s tour de force would become one of this century’s most unsettling indictments of war.

After the Fair, Guernica tours Europe and Northern America to raise consciousness about the threat of fascism. From the beginning of World War II until 1981, Guernica is housed in its temporary home at the Museum of Modern Art in New York, though it makes frequent trips abroad to such places as Munich, Cologne, Stockholm, and even Sao Palo in Brazil. The one place it does not go is Spain. Although Picasso had always intended for the mural to be owned by the Spanish people, he refuses to allow it to travel to Spain until the country enjoys “public liberties and democratic institutions.”

Speculations as to the exact meaning of the jumble of tortured images are as numerous and varied as the people who have viewed the painting. There is no doubt that Guernica challenges our notions of warfare as heroic and exposes it as a brutal act of self-destruction. But it is a hallmark of Picasso’s art that any symbol can hold many, often contradictory meanings, and the precise significance of the imagery in Guernica remains ambiguous. When asked to explain his symbolism, Picasso remarked, “It isn’t up to the painter to define the symbols. Otherwise it would be better if he wrote them out in so many words! The public who look at the picture must interpret the symbols as they understand them.”

In 1973, Pablo Picasso, the most influential artist of the twentieth century, dies at the age of ninety-two. And when Franco dies in 1975, Spain moves closer to its dream of democracy. On the centenary of Picasso’s birth, October 25th, 1981, Spain’s new Republic carries out the best commemoration possible: the return of Guernica to Picasso’s native soil in a testimony of national reconciliation. In its final journey, Picasso’s apocalyptic vision has served as a banner for a nation on its path toward freedom and democracy.

Now showcased at the Reina Sofía, Spain’s national museum of modern art, Guernica is acclaimed as an artistic masterpiece, taking its rightful place among the great Spanish treasures of El Greco, Goya and Velázquez. “A lot of people recognize the painting,” says art historian Patricia Failing. “They may not even know that it’s a Picasso, but they recognize the image. It’s a kind of icon.”
Consider the genres you studied in this activity. What are their similarities and differences? What can one genre do that another cannot?

Brainstorm other art forms that can be used in protest of injustice.

Choose the art form represented in this activity that you believe is most persuasive, and write a reflection on what elements of the text most move you. Be sure to address the essential question, “How does one construct a persuasive argument?”

**Literary Terms**

A genre is a kind or style of literature or art. For example, poetry, short story, and memoir are literary genres. Painting and sculpture are artistic genres. Each genre has specific characteristics.
1. Music has a long tradition as a vehicle for protesting injustice. What do you know about protest songs? Brainstorm a list of protest songs, artists, and issues.

2. Listen to a protest song and read the lyrics. Who do you think was the target audience for this song? Support your answer with evidence from the lyrics.

3. Describe the language used in the song. Is this language appropriate for the target audience? Why or why not?

4. How could someone use music to raise awareness and raise funds to fight another important concern? Make a plan:
5. Examine the features of *genres* you have studied in this unit. Space is provided for you to include additional features and genres on the graphic organizer. Be prepared to explain your thinking.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Use powerful words</th>
<th>Use powerful images</th>
<th>Use music</th>
<th>Appeal to logos</th>
<th>Appeal to ethos</th>
<th>Appeal to pathos</th>
<th>Take audience into account</th>
<th>Use facts for support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Editorial</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essay</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Print Ad</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Film</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drama</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>News Article</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speech</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Letter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Painting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photo Essay</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Song</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. Revisit the anticipation guide you completed for the International Justice activity (Activity 4.5). Have you changed your mind about any of the statements? Explain.
Assignment

Your assignment is to compose a persuasive text about an issue of justice that is important to you. You will choose an appropriate audience and genre for your argument.

Steps

Prewriting

1. You and your classmates have brainstormed several issues related to justice. Choose an issue that matters to you personally. If you need to learn more about the issue, conduct research to help you make a convincing argument. Formulate goals and a working thesis and begin to think of support.

2. Identify potential audiences for your persuasive piece. For each, analyze their interest in and power of influence on the issue. Based on your analysis, narrow your list. Once you decide on an audience, you will want to further analyze the background knowledge of the audience; in addition, consider which persuasive appeals might be most effective with this audience.

3. Consider genres that would be appropriate for persuading this audience about your issue. Review the features of the genre you think would work best. You might want to discuss your plan with a classmate to clarify and refine your thinking about this issue, audience, and genre.

Drafting

4. Use ideas from your prewriting to generate a draft. Be sure to adhere to essential features of the genre you selected. As you compose your persuasive piece, you will probably want to refine your thesis, always striving to match your language to the intended audience.

5. Review your piece carefully from the perspective of your intended audience and revise accordingly. Then share your piece to get response from at least one other person. Your reviewer(s) should be able to find or infer your thesis and should provide feedback on the support you have provided. He or she should also provide feedback on your use of genre and on the connection between the issue, audience, and genre.

Editing/Publishing

6. Use all available resources to prepare a polished piece, and then share the piece with your intended audience.

7. Reflect on the product you have created and what you have learned about constructing a persuasive argument. If you receive a response from your intended audience, evaluate your work in terms of that response, as well.
## SCORING GUIDE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scoring Criteria</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ideas</strong></td>
<td>The text presents a significant and compelling thesis on an issue of justice that is clearly developed and supported. The argument is convincing and adeptly utilizes a variety of persuasive appeals.</td>
<td>The text presents a clear thesis on an issue of justice that is sufficiently developed and supported. The argument is plausible and effectively uses persuasive appeals.</td>
<td>The text takes on a position that is difficult to distinguish on an issue of justice. The position is insufficiently developed and supported. An attempt has been made to make an argument, but it is not plausible and uses persuasive appeals ineffectively.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organization</strong></td>
<td>The text is organized aptly for the genre. Ideas are presented in the order most conducive to a coherent argument.</td>
<td>The text is organized appropriately for the genre. Ideas are logically arranged to support the argument.</td>
<td>The organization of the text does not match the genre. A weak arrangement of ideas detracts from the argument at times.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Genre-Specific Features</strong></td>
<td>Genre-specific features such as diction, syntax, factual support, and so on create a specific tone for a particular audience and purpose. These features reflect an authentic, confident, authoritative voice.</td>
<td>Genre-specific features such as diction, syntax, factual support, and so on are chosen to create a clear tone for a particular audience and purpose. These features reflect a convincing and appropriate voice.</td>
<td>Genre-specific features such as diction, syntax, factual support, and so on convey an ambiguous tone inconsistent for a particular audience and purpose. These features do not reflect a convincing voice.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conventions</strong></td>
<td>A strong control and mastery of standard conventions is demonstrated. Either no errors appear, or they are so slight that they do not interfere with the meaning.</td>
<td>Control of standard writing conventions is demonstrated. Though some errors may appear, they do not seriously interfere with the meaning.</td>
<td>There are frequent errors in standard conventions that seriously interfere with the meaning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Writing Process</strong></td>
<td>The final product demonstrates thoughtful planning, significant revision, and careful editing in preparing for publication.</td>
<td>The final product demonstrates planning, revision, and editing in preparing for publication.</td>
<td>The final product lacks evidence of planning, revision, and/or editing. It is not ready for publication.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## SCORING GUIDE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scoring Criteria</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reflection</strong></td>
<td>The reflection perceptively analyzes what the author has learned about constructing a persuasive argument. Specific and well-chosen examples support the analysis, including reference to the audience’s response if given.</td>
<td>The reflection analyzes what the author has learned about constructing a persuasive argument. Relevant examples are cited to support the analysis, including reference to the audience’s response if given.</td>
<td>The reflection does not thoroughly analyze what the author has learned about constructing a persuasive argument. Too few or no examples are cited to support analysis.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Additional Criteria**

Comments:

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
Learning Focus:

From Ancient Beliefs to Our Own

You have studied texts, ancient and contemporary, that address issues of justice. You have learned that the need to determine what is right is timeless; all cultures in all times have dealt with issues of justice in their own ways. Great literature, beginning with the literature of ancient Greece, gives us insight into the universality of the human struggle with issues of justice and injustice. Sophocles, one of the great Greek tragic dramatists, dramatizes the story of Antigone as a struggle for what is right, fair, and just, capturing the timeless truth that the quest for meaning is just as much a personal and political quest as it is a metaphysical one. A metaphysical search is, in essence, a search for the meaning of existence.

In your previous performances, you used theatrical elements to express your group’s interpretation of the text. In this unit, you will have the opportunity to spotlight an issue of justice from the play through your own writing and performance. You and your group will collaborate to create a stylized expression of social and metaphysical truths about one of the most basic of human impulses – the quest for justice in a world that is not always just.
Read the brief character situations from the plot of the tragedy *Antigone*. Next, work with a small group to adopt the point of view of three of the characters. Fill out the chart below with your group. Then, join with another group to describe the remaining characters.

### Creon

Your nephews have killed each other in a battle over who should be king. You are now king and decree that one brother can be buried according to the customs of your land but the other cannot. You find out that someone has defied your rule.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Three adjectives that describe how you feel</th>
<th>Why do you feel this way?</th>
<th>What will you do?</th>
<th>Why do you think this is a just response?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### Antigone

Your brother has been killed in battle. The king has decreed that no one should bury him. You break the law and bury your brother.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Three adjectives that describe how you feel</th>
<th>Why do you feel this way?</th>
<th>What will you do?</th>
<th>Why do you think this is a just response?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Ismene
Your sister has committed a serious offense against the law of the land, something you would never do. One of your brothers has been buried lawfully; the other has not.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Three adjectives that describe how you feel</th>
<th>Why do you feel this way?</th>
<th>What will you do?</th>
<th>Why do you think this is a <em>just</em> response?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Haemon
Your fiancée has buried her brother, which she has been forbidden to do by your father, the king.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Three adjectives that describe how you feel</th>
<th>Why do you feel this way?</th>
<th>What will you do?</th>
<th>Why do you think this is a <em>just</em> response?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
**The Chorus**

The king has made a law. Someone you respect has broken that law for reasons you think are justifiable.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Three adjectives that describe how you feel</th>
<th>Why do you feel this way?</th>
<th>What will you do?</th>
<th>Why do you think this is a <em>just</em> response?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**The Guard**

Your job is to guard a corpse to make sure no one buries it. During a dust storm, someone buries the body. Later you catch someone burying the body again. You take the person to the king.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Three adjectives that describe how you feel</th>
<th>Why do you feel this way?</th>
<th>What will you do?</th>
<th>Why do you think this is a <em>just</em> response?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
### Meet the Cadmus Family

**SUGGESTED LEARNING STRATEGIES:** Discussion Groups, Notetaking, Graphic Organizer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>About the Author</th>
<th>It’s a Tragedy</th>
<th>Greek Theater</th>
<th>Antigone and Her Family</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>$200</strong> He was the author of <em>Oedipus Rex, Oedipus at Colonus and Antigone.</em></td>
<td><strong>$200</strong> This civilization made tragedy into an art.</td>
<td><strong>$200</strong> This city was where tragedies were produced as part of a religious festival.</td>
<td><strong>$200</strong> The other two plays in the series with Antigone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>$400</strong> This is the number of Sophocles’ plays that exist today out of a total of more than 100.</td>
<td><strong>$400</strong> Downfall, usually ending with destruction or death</td>
<td><strong>$400</strong> The part of a Greek play usually chanted (or sung) in unison</td>
<td><strong>$400</strong> The King and Queen of Thebes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>$600</strong> It was the “Golden Age” in ancient Greece.</td>
<td><strong>$600</strong> Pity and fear, wonder and awe</td>
<td><strong>$600</strong> Platform shoes and masks with built-in megaphones</td>
<td><strong>$600</strong> “Your son will kill his father and marry his own mother.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>$800</strong> This was Sophocles’ age when he won his first drama competition.</td>
<td><strong>$800</strong> A single flaw in character, or hamartia</td>
<td><strong>$800</strong> A group of actors that moved and sang together, acting as one character</td>
<td><strong>$800</strong> Both mother and wife of Oedipus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>$1,000</strong> This was the number of actors Sophocles had in the cast of his plays.</td>
<td><strong>$1,000</strong> Horrible truth that leads to release</td>
<td><strong>$1,000</strong> The Greek word for actor</td>
<td><strong>$1,000</strong> The decree of Creon that begins the action of the play</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Tragedy**

- The legend of the phoenix stems from Greek mythology—strength and life arise from destruction.
- A difficult and rewarding form of drama—made into an art by the Greeks.
- Involves the downfall of a hero, usually ending with his or her destruction or death.
Meet the Cadmus Family

- Involves intense emotion; horrible truth that leads to release or catharsis.
- Aristotle’s Poetics states that:
  - Tragedy arouses the emotions of pity and fear, wonder and awe.
  - A tragic hero must be a man or woman capable of great suffering.
  - Tragedy explores the interactions of gods and mortals.
  - Tragedy purifies the emotions.
  - Tragedy shows how the hero is brought to disaster by hamartia, or a single flaw in character.

Greek Theater

- Tragedies were produced as part of a religious festival every year in Athens.
- Awards were given to the playwright who presented the best series of three dramas.
- Plays were performed in vast outdoor amphitheaters that could seat 40,000.
- All actors were men. They wore masks with built-in megaphones so they could be heard; they also wore platform shoes for added height.
- The stage was a slightly raised platform.
- Actors’ movements were bold and definite.
- The Chorus—a group of actors who moved and sang together—acted as one character and spoke in unison during the Choral Odes, which separated the scenes of the drama.
- The Chorus set the mood, summarized the action, represented a point of view, sided with various characters, or warned of disaster.
- Greek theater incorporated unities of time, place, and action, which meant that there were no scene changes, and no complicated subplots; the plays took place in one day and in one place and focused on one event.
- Violent action took place offstage; messengers told the audience what happened.
- The audience knew the story ahead of time. The emotion of the characters is what they came to see.
Author Information: Sophocles

- Was one of three great Greek tragic playwrights (with Aeschylus and Euripides); wrote during the “Golden Age” of ancient Greece
- Born in 496 BC—lived for 90 years
- Wrote over 100 plays—only seven remain
- Served his city of Colonus, near Athens, in various capacities
- Entered his plays in contests—won his first at age 28
- Defeated Aeschylus in that competition
- Awarded first prize about 20 times and second place prizes all other times
- Added the third actor to the cast of his plays—before this, all dramas were played with only two characters other than the Chorus

Antigone and Her Family Background

- Antigone is a complete play, but it is part of a cycle of three plays, including Oedipus Rex and Oedipus at Colonus, written by Sophocles about the generations of the Cadmus family.
- The plays deal with the curse placed upon the family for a crime committed against the gods. The curse begins with a prophecy to King Laius and Queen Jocasta of Thebes that their son, Oedipus, will kill his father and marry his own mother.
- To avoid fulfillment of the prophecy, the baby Oedipus was left in the mountains to die of exposure, but was found and raised by the king and queen of Corinth, not knowing his birth parents.
- Later Oedipus unknowingly kills his father and wins the hand of Jocasta, the widowed queen, thus fulfilling the prophecy. They have four children, Antigone, Ismene, Eteocles, and Polyniceces.
- When Jocasta discovers the truth, she hangs herself. When Oedipus discovers the truth, he blinds and exiles himself. He leaves his brother-in-law, Creon, to look after his children.
- Before he dies, Oedipus leaves orders that his two sons share the kingship; however, Eteocles, the first to reign, refuses to step down. Polyniceces, his brother, attacks the city and his brother. They kill each other in battle.
- Creon becomes king and orders Eteocles buried with religious rites and honors. He orders that Polyniceces be left unburied and uncovered for birds and animals to feed on his body. According to Greek beliefs, his soul could thus never rest. Antigone buries her brother against the order of her uncle. Thus begins the play’s action.

GRAMMAR & USAGE

When the Chorus Leader says that Antigone’s brothers “…set their conquering spears against each other” (line 172), he uses a reciprocal pronoun: each other. Reciprocal pronouns include each other and one another. When you write, use each other to refer to two people and one another to refer to three or more.
**Drama Games**

You are going to be either an actor or an audience member in a drama game. Whichever you are, you should be actively engaged. The rules of the game are as follows:

- Only four words can be spoken: “Hi Honey, I’m Home.” Actors will receive cards with these words and a brief scenario. Each will make an entrance saying only the four words and using appropriate gestures and movements to convey the situation.

- Actors will make a mask that reflects the emotion of the scenario on the card and wear it during the entrance.

- You will watch this enactment and try to guess what the scenario is by observing the actor’s movements and listening to his or her voice. After you take notes on the performance, share them verbally with the class, discussing elements that were effective.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Visual Delivery (gestures, posture, movement, eye contact)</th>
<th>Facial Expression on Mask</th>
<th>Vocal Delivery (pitch, volume, pace, rate, pauses, vocal variety, pronunciation/articulation)</th>
<th>Scenario</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Reflection:** You have worked toward goals for improving your speaking and listening skills in small groups. In the remainder of the unit, you will have opportunities to speak before a larger group and to listen to presentations. Think about your strengths and weaknesses in presentation situations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>My Strengths as a Listener</th>
<th>My Weaknesses as a Listener</th>
<th>Goals for Improvement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>My Strengths as a Speaker</th>
<th>My Weaknesses as a Speaker</th>
<th>Goals for Improvement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The word **chorus** has multiple meanings. Add details to the graphic organizer to show how chorus functions in the texts listed in the circles.

**Academic Vocabulary**

In traditional or classic drama, the **chorus** is a group of performers who speak as one and comment on the action of the play.
Read the opening scene from *Antigone* through the Second Ode, which ends at line 423.

As you read, focus on the dramatic, emotional nature of the dialogue. Take notes on different aspects of the play, keeping in mind the elements of Greek tragedy as well as character intent and emotion, which you will incorporate in your performance later in this unit.

For this scene, your teacher will assign parts. Read aloud with appropriate vocal inflection. Antigone and Ismene in the opening scene, and then Creon and the Guard in the second scene, use a convention called *stichomythia*—fast-paced alternating dialogue. If you are playing one of those characters, practice this convention as you read and incorporate appropriate gestures with your lines.

If you are assigned to the Chorus, practice moving and chanting as you read. While reading Strophe 1, the Chorus should chant and “dance” across to the right, and while chanting Antistrophe 2, dance back to the left. The point is to practice with multiple voices to understand the choral nature of the speeches.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Character</th>
<th>Adjectives to Describe the Character</th>
<th>Quotes that Show Character Intent or Emotion</th>
<th>Is the character involved in an issue of justice? Explain.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Antigone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ismene</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creon</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guard</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© 2011 College Board. All rights reserved.
Drama

About the Author

Few records exist that can tell the story of the life of Sophocles (c. 496 B.C.–406 B.C.), one of the great playwrights of the golden age of ancient Greece. He spent his life in the historically and politically important city-state of Athens, where he benefited from family wealth, good social connections, an excellent education, a winning personality, and a talent for writing plays that perfectly captured the spirit of his time and place. Sophocles is credited with several innovations to the dramatic form. Increasing the number of characters in a play, for example, allowed him to make the plots more complex and interesting to audiences. By focusing on characters' fatal flaws, poor decisions, and moral dilemmas, he created suspenseful plays that also evoked audiences' sympathies.

Antigone

by Sophocles

ANTIGONE: daughter of Oedipus.
ISMENE: daughter of Oedipus, sister of Antigone
CREON: king of Thebes
EURYDICE: wife of Creon
HAEMON: son of Creon and Eurydice, engaged to Antigone
TEIRESIAS: an old blind prophet
BOY: a young lad guiding Teiresias
GUARD: a soldier serving Creon
MESSENGER
CHORUS: Theban Elders
ATTENDANTS
[Thebes, in front of the palace, which stands in the background, its main doors facing the audience. Enter Antigone leading Ismene away from the palace]

ANTIGONE  Now, dear Ismene, my own blood sister, do you have any sense of all the troubles Zeus keeps bringing on the two of us, as long as we’re alive? All that misery which stems from Oedipus? There’s no suffering, no shame, no ruin—not one dishonour—which I have not seen in all the troubles you and I go through. What’s this they’re saying now, something our general has had proclaimed throughout the city? Do you know of it? Have you heard? Or have you just missed the news? Dishonours which better fit our enemies are now being piled up on the ones we love.

ISMENE  I’ve had no word at all, Antigone, nothing good or bad about our family, not since we two lost both our brothers, killed on the same day by a double blow. And since the Argive army, just last night, has gone away, I don’t know any more if I’ve been lucky or face total ruin.

ANTIGONE  I know that. That’s why I brought you here, outside the gates, so only you can hear.

ISMENE  What is it? The way you look makes it seem you’re thinking of some dark and gloomy news.

ANTIGONE  Look—what’s Creon doing with our two brothers? He’s honouring one with a full funeral and treating the other one disgracefully! Eteocles, they say, has had his burial according to our customary rites, to win him honour with the dead below. But as for Polynice, who perished so miserably, an order has gone out throughout the city—that’s what people say. He’s to have no funeral or lament, but to be left unburied and unwept, a sweet treasure for the birds to look at, for them to feed on to their heart’s content. That’s what people say the noble Creon has announced to you and me—I mean to me—

---

1 Thebes: capital city of ancient Egypt
2 Argive army: refers to the city of Argos, where Polynice raised an army to fight his brother Eteocles for the throne
3 sweet treasure: refers to Polynice’s body left unburied, which birds and other creatures will gorge on
and now he’s coming to proclaim the fact, to state it clearly to those who have not heard. For Creon this matter’s really serious. Anyone who acts against the order will be stoned to death before the city. Now you know, and you’ll quickly demonstrate whether you are nobly born, or else a girl unworthy of her splendid ancestors.

ISMENE Oh my poor sister, if that’s what’s happening, what can I say that would be any help to ease the situation or resolve it?

ANTIGONE Think whether you will work with me in this and act together.

ISMENE In what kind of work? What do you mean?

ANTIGONE Will you help these hands take up Polynoeices’ corpse and bury it?

ISMENE What? You’re going to bury Polynoeices, when that’s been made a crime for all in Thebes?

ANTIGONE Yes. I’ll do my duty to my brother—and yours as well, if you’re not prepared to. I won’t be caught betraying him.

ISMENE You’re too rash. Has Creon not expressly banned that act?

ANTIGONE Yes. But he’s no right to keep me from what’s mine.

ISMENE O dear. Think, Antigone. Consider how our father died, hated and disgraced, when those mistakes which his own search revealed forced him to turn his hand against himself and stab out both his eyes. Then that woman, his mother and his wife—her double role—destroyed her own life in a twisted noose. Then there’s our own two brothers, both butchered in a single day—that ill-fated pair with their own hands slaughtered one another and brought about their common doom. Now, the two of us are left here quite alone. Think how we’ll die far worse than all the rest, if we defy the law and move against the king’s decree, against his royal power. We must remember that by birth we’re women,
and, as such, we shouldn't fight with men. Since those who rule are much more powerful, we must obey in this and in events which bring us even harsher agonies. So I'll ask those underground for pardon—since I'm being compelled, I will obey those in control. That's what I'm forced to do. It makes no sense to try to do too much.

ANTIGONE

I wouldn't urge you to. No. Not even if you were keen to act. Doing this with you would bring me no joy. So be what you want. I'll still bury him. It would be fine to die while doing that. I'll lie there with him, with a man I love, pure and innocent, for all my crime. My honours for the dead must last much longer than for those up here. I'll lie down there forever. As for you, well, if you wish, you can show contempt for those laws the gods all hold in honour.

ISMENE

I'm not disrespecting them. But I can't act against the state. That's not in my nature.

ANTIGONE

Let that be your excuse. I'm going now to make a burial mound for my dear brother.

ISMENE

Oh poor Antigone, I'm so afraid for you.

ANTIGONE

Don't fear for me. Set your own fate in order.

ISMENE

Make sure you don't reveal to anyone what you intend. Keep it closely hidden. I'll do the same.

ANTIGONE

No, no. Announce the fact—if you don't let everybody know, I'll despise your silence even more.

ISMENE

Your heart is hot to do cold deeds.

ANTIGONE

But I know, I'll please the ones I'm duty bound to please.

ISMENE

Yes, if you can. But you're after something which you're incapable of carrying out.

ANTIGONE

Well, when my strength is gone, then I'll give up.

ISMENE

A vain attempt should not be made at all.

ANTIGONE

I'll hate you if you're going to talk that way. And you'll rightly earn the loathing of the dead. So leave me and my foolishness alone—we'll get through this fearful thing. I won't suffer anything as bad as a disgraceful death.
in all their clanging golden pride, 
he hurled his fire and struck the man, 
up there, on our battlements, as he began 
to scream aloud his victory.

CHORUS – *Strophe 2*

The man swung down, torch still in hand, 
and smashed into unyielding earth—
the one who not so long ago attacked,
who launched his furious, enraged assault,
to blast us, breathing raging storms.
But things turned out not as he’d hoped.
Great war god Ares\(^{10}\) assisted us—
he smashed them down and doomed them all
to a very different fate.

CHORUS LEADER
Seven captains at seven gates
matched against seven equal warriors
paid Zeus\(^{11}\) their full bronze tribute,
the god who turns the battle tide,
all but that pair of wretched men,
born of one father and one mother, too—
who set their conquering spears against each other
and then both shared a common death.

CHORUS – *Antistrophe 2*

Now victory with her glorious name
has come, bringing joy to well-armed Thebes.
The battle’s done—let’s strive now to forget
with songs and dancing all night long,
with Bacchus\(^{12}\) leading us to make Thebes shake.

*[The palace doors are thrown open and guards appear at the doors]*

CHORUS LEADER
But here comes Creon, new king of our land,
son of Menoikeos. Thanks to the gods,
who’ve brought about our new good fortune.
What plan of action does he have in mind?
What’s made him hold this special meeting,
with elders summoned by a general call?

*[Enter Creon from the palace]*

CREON
Men, after much tossing of our ship of state,
the gods have safely set things right again.
Of all the citizens I’ve summoned you,

---

\(^{10}\) *Ares*: god of war

\(^{11}\) *Zeus*: supreme ruler of all the gods on Mount Olympus; also known as the weather god who controlled thunder, lightning, and rain

\(^{12}\) *Bacchus*: Roman god of wine; equated to Dionysius, the Greek god of wine
because I know how well you showed respect for the eternal power of the throne, first with Laius and again with Oedipus, once he restored our city. When he died, you stood by his children, firm in loyalty. Now his sons have perished in a single day, killing each other with their own two hands, a double slaughter, stained with brother's blood. And so I have the throne, all royal power, for I'm the one most closely linked by blood to those who have been killed. It's impossible to really know a man, to know his soul, his mind and will, before one witnesses his skill in governing and making laws. For me, a man who rules the entire state and does not take the best advice there is, but through fear keeps his mouth forever shut, such a man is the very worst of men—and always will be. And a man who thinks more highly of a friend than of his country, well, he means nothing to me. Let Zeus know, the god who always watches everything, I would not stay silent if I saw disaster moving here against the citizens, a threat to their security. For anyone who acts against the state, its enemy, I'd never make my friend. For I know well our country is a ship which keeps us safe, and only when it sails its proper course do we make friends. These are the principles I'll use in order to protect our state. That's why I've announced to all citizens my orders for the sons of Oedipus—Eteocles, who perished in the fight to save our city, the best and bravest of our spearmen, will have his burial, with all those purifying rituals which accompany the noblest corpses, as they move below. As for his brother—that Polynices, who returned from exile, eager to wipe out in all-consuming fire his ancestral city and its native gods, keen to seize upon his family's blood and lead men into slavery—for him, the proclamation in the state declares he'll have no burial mound, no funeral rites,
and no lament. He’ll be left unburied,  
his body there for birds and dogs to eat,  
a clear reminder of his shameful fate.  
That’s my decision. For I’ll never act  
to respect an evil man with honours  
in preference to a man who’s acted well.  
Anyone who’s well disposed towards our state,  
alive or dead, that man I will respect.  
240

CHORUS LEADER  Son of Menoikeos, if that’s your will  
for this city’s friends and enemies,  
it seems to me you now control all laws  
concerning those who’ve died and us as well—  
the ones who are still living.

CREON  See to it then, and act as guardians of what’s been proclaimed.

CHORUS  Give that task to younger men to deal with.

CREON  There are men assigned to oversee the corpse.

CHORUS LEADER  Then what remains that you would have us do?

CREON  Don’t yield to those who contravene¹³ my orders.

CHORUS LEADER  No one is such a fool that he loves death.

CREON  Yes, that will be his full reward, indeed.  
And yet men have often been destroyed  
because they hoped to profit in some way.

[Enter a guard, coming towards the palace]

GUARD  My lord, I can’t say I’ve come out of breath  
by running here, making my feet move fast.  
Many times I stopped to think things over—  
and then I’d turn around, retrace my steps.  
My mind was saying many things to me,  
“You fool, why go to where you know for sure  
your punishment awaits?”—”And now, poor man,  
why are you hesitating yet again?  
If Creon finds this out from someone else,  
how will you escape being hurt?” Such matters  
kept my mind preoccupied. And so I went,  
slowly and reluctantly, and thus made  
a short road turn into a lengthy one.  
But then the view that I should come to you  
owned out. If what I have to say is nothing,  
I’ll say it nonetheless. For I’ve come here  
clinging to the hope that I’ll not suffer  
anything that’s not part of my destiny.

¹³ contravene: oppose, or act contrary to
CREON  What’s happening that’s made you so upset?
GUARD  I want to tell you first about myself. I did not do it. And I didn’t see the one who did. So it would be unjust if I should come to grief.
CREON  You hedge\textsuperscript{14} so much. Clearly you have news of something ominous.
GUARD  Yes. Strange things that make me pause a lot.
CREON  Why not say it and then go—just leave.
GUARD  All right, I’ll tell you. It’s about the corpse. Someone has buried it and disappeared, after spreading thirsty dust onto the flesh and undertaking all appropriate rites.
CREON  What are you saying? What man would dare this?
GUARD  I don’t know. There was no sign of digging, no marks of any pick axe or a mattock. The ground was dry and hard and very smooth, without a wheel track. Whoever did it left no trace. When the first man on day watch revealed it to us, we were all amazed. The corpse was hidden, but not in a tomb. It was lightly covered up with dirt, as if someone wanted to avert a curse. There was no trace of a wild animal or dogs who’d come to rip the corpse apart. Then the words flew round among us all, with every guard accusing someone else.
CREON  We were about to fight, to come to blows—no one was there to put a stop to it. Every one of us was responsible, but none of us was clearly in the wrong. In our defence we pleaded ignorance. Then we each stated we were quite prepared to pick up red-hot iron, walk through flames, or swear by all the gods that we’d not done it, we’d no idea how the act was planned, or how it had been carried out. At last, when all our searching had proved useless, one man spoke up, and his words forced us all to drop our faces to the ground in fear. We couldn’t see things working out for us, whether we agreed or disagreed with him. He said we must report this act to you—

\textsuperscript{14} hedge: avoiding giving a clear response
we must not hide it. And his view prevailed. I was the unlucky man who won the prize, the luck of the draw. That’s why I’m now here, not of my own free will or by your choice. I know that—for no one likes a messenger who comes bearing unwelcome news with him.

CHORUS LEADER My lord, I’ve been wondering for some time now—could this act not be something from the gods?

CREON Stop now—before what you’re about to say enrages me completely and reveals that you’re not only old but stupid, too. No one can tolerate what you’ve just said, when you claim gods might care about this corpse. Would they pay extraordinary honours and bury as a man who’d served them well, someone who came to burn their offerings, their pillared temples, to torch their lands and scatter all its laws? Or do you see gods paying respect to evil men? No, no. For quite a while some people in the town have secretly been muttering against me. They don’t agree with what I have decreed. They shake their heads and have not kept their necks under my yoke, as they are duty bound to do if they were men who are content with me. I well know that these guards were led astray—such men urged them to carry out this act for money. To foster evil actions, to make them commonplace among all men, nothing is as powerful as money. It destroys cities, driving men from home. Money trains and twists the minds in worthy men, so they then undertake disgraceful acts. Money teaches men to live as scoundrels, familiar with every profane enterprise. But those who carry out such acts for cash sooner or later see how for their crimes they pay the penalty. For if great Zeus still has my respect, then understand this—I swear to you on oath—unless you find the one whose hands really buried him, unless you bring him here before my eyes, then death for you will never be enough. No, not before you’re hung up still alive.
and you confess to this gross, violent act.
That way you’ll understand in future days,
when there’s a profit to be gained from theft,
you’ll learn that it’s not good to be in love
with every kind of monetary gain.
You’ll know more men are ruined than are saved
when they earn profits from dishonest schemes.

GUARD Do I have your permission to speak now,
or do I just turn around and go away?
CREON But I find your voice so irritating—
don’t you realize that?

GUARD Where does it hurt? Is it in your ears or in your mind?
CREON Why try to question where I feel my pain?
GUARD The man who did it—he upsets your mind.
I offend your ears.
CREON My, my, it’s clear to see
it’s natural for you to chatter on.
GUARD Perhaps. But I never did this.
CREON This and more—you sold your life for silver.
GUARD How strange and sad when the one who sorts this out gets it all wrong.
CREON Well, enjoy your sophisticated views.

GUARD But if you don’t reveal to me who did this,
you’ll just confirm how much your treasonous gains
have made you suffer.

[Exit Creon back into the palace. The doors close behind him]

GUARD Well, I hope he’s found.
That would be best. But whether caught or not—
and that’s something sheer chance will bring about—
you won’t see me coming here again.

[Exit the Guard away from the palace]

SECOND ODE

CHORUS – Strophe 1
There are many strange and wonderful things,
but nothing more strangely wonderful than man.
He moves across the white-capped ocean seas
blasted by winter storms, carving his way
under the surging waves engulfing him.
With his teams of horses he wears down
the unwearied and immortal earth, 
the oldest of the gods, harassing her, 
as year by year his ploughs move back and forth.  

Antistrophe 1  
He snare the light-winged flocks of birds, 
herds of wild beasts, creatures from deep seas, 
trapped in the fine mesh of his hunting nets. 
O resourceful man, whose skill can overcome 
ferocious beasts roaming mountain heights. 
He curbs the rough-haired horses with his bit 
and tames the inexhaustible mountain bulls, 
setting their savage necks beneath his yoke.

Strophe 2  
He's taught himself speech and wind-swift thought, 
trained his feelings for communal civic life, 
learning to escape the icy shafts of frost, 
volleys of pelting rain in winter storms, 
the harsh life lived under the open sky. 
That's man—so resourceful in all he does. 
There's no event his skill cannot confront— 
other than death—that alone he cannot shun, 
although for many baffling sicknesses 
he has discovered his own remedies.

Antistrophe 1  
The qualities of his inventive skills 
bring arts beyond his dreams and lead him on, 
sometimes to evil and sometimes to good. 
If he treats his country's laws with due respect 
and honours justice by swearing on the gods, 
he wins high honours in his city. 
But when he grows bold and turns to evil, 
then he has no city. A man like that— 
let him not share my home or know my mind.

[Enter the Guard, with Antigone.]

CHORUS LEADER  What's this? I fear some omen from the gods. 
I can't deny what I see here so clearly— that young girl there—it's Antigone. 
Oh you poor girl, daughter of Oedipus, 
child of a such a father, so unfortunate, 
what's going on? Surely they've not brought you here because you've disobeyed the royal laws, 
because they've caught you acting foolishly? 

GUARD  This here's the one who carried out the act. 
We caught her as she was burying the corpse. 
Where's Creon?

[The palace doors open. Enter Creon with attendants]
CHORUS LEADER: He's coming from the house—and just in time.

CREON: Why have I come “just in time”?

What's happening? What is it?

GUARD: My lord,

human beings should never take an oath
there's something they'll not do—for later thoughts
contradict what they first meant. I'd have sworn
I'd not soon venture here again. Back then,
the threats you made brought me a lot of grief.
But there's no joy as great as what we pray for
against all hope. And so I have come back,
breaking that oath I swore. I bring this girl,
captured while she was honouring the grave.
This time we did not draw lots. No. This time
I was the lucky man, not someone else.
And now, my lord, take her for questioning.
Convict her. Do as you wish. As for me,
by rights I'm free and clear of all this trouble.

CREON: This girl here—how did you catch her? And where?

GUARD: She was burying that man. Now you know
all there is to know.

CREON: Do you understand just what you're saying? Are your words the truth?

GUARD: We saw this girl giving that dead man's corpse
full burial rites—an act you'd made illegal.
Is what I say simple and clear enough?

CREON: How did you see her, catch her in the act?

GUARD: It happened this way. When we got there,
after hearing those awful threats from you,
we swept off all the dust covering the corpse,
so the damp body was completely bare.
Then we sat down on rising ground up wind,
to escape the body's putrid rotting stench.
We traded insults just to stay awake,
in case someone was careless on the job.
That's how we spent the time right up ’til noon,
when the sun's bright circle in the sky
had moved half way and it was burning hot.

Then suddenly a swirling windstorm came,
whipping clouds of dust up from the ground,
filling the plain—some heaven-sent trouble.
In that level place the dirt storm damaged
all the forest growth, and the air around
was filled with dust for miles. We shut our mouths
and just endured this scourge sent from the gods.  
A long time passed. The storm came to an end.  
That’s when we saw the girl. She was shrieking—  
a distressing painful cry, just like a bird  
who’s seen an empty nest, its fledglings gone.  
That’s how she was when she saw the naked corpse.  
She screamed out a lament, and then she swore,  
calling evil curses down upon the ones  
tho’d done this. Then right away her hands  
throw on the thirsty dust. She lifted up  
a finely made bronze jug and then three times  
poured out her tributes to the dead.  
When we saw that, we rushed up right away  
and grabbed her. She was not afraid at all.  
We charged her with her previous offence  
as well as this one. She just kept standing there,  
denying nothing. That made me happy—  
though it was painful, too. For it’s a joy  
escaping troubles which affect oneself,  
but painful to bring evil on one’s friends.  
But all that is of less concern to me  
than my own safety.

CREON  You there—you with your face  
bent down towards the ground, what do you say?  
Do you deny you did this or admit it?

ANTIGONE  I admit I did it. I won’t deny that.

CREON  [to the Guard]  
You’re dismissed—go where you want. You’re free—  
no serious charges made against you.

[Exit the Guard. Creon turns to interrogate Antigone]

Tell me briefly—not in some lengthy speech—  
were you aware there was a proclamation  
forbidding what you did?

ANTIGONE  I’d heard of it. How could I not? It was public knowledge.

CREON  And yet you dared to break those very laws?

ANTIGONE  Yes. Zeus did not announce those laws to me.  
And Justice living with the gods below  
sent no such laws for men. I did not think  
anything which you proclaimed strong enough  
to let a mortal override the gods  
and their unwritten and unchanging laws.  
They’re not just for today or yesterday,  
but exist forever, and no one knows
where they first appeared. So I did not mean to let a fear of any human will lead to my punishment among the gods.

I know all too well I'm going to die—how could I not?—it makes no difference what you decree. And if I have to die before my time, well, I count that a gain. When someone has to live the way I do, surrounded by so many evil things, how can she fail to find a benefit in death? And so for me meeting this fate won't bring any pain. But if I'd allowed my own mother's dead son to just lie there, an unburied corpse, then I'd feel distress. What going on here does not hurt me at all. If you think what I'm doing now is stupid, perhaps I'm being charged with foolishness by someone who's a fool.

CHORUS LEADER It's clear enough the spirit in this girl is passionate—her father was the same. She has no sense of compromise in times of trouble.

CREON [to the Chorus Leader]
But you should know the most obdurate\textsuperscript{16} wills are those most prone to break. The strongest iron tempered in the fire to make it really hard—that's the kind you see most often shatter. I'm well aware the most tempestuous horses are tamed by one small bit. Pride has no place in anyone who is his neighbour's slave.

This girl here was already very insolent in contravening laws we had proclaimed. Here she again displays her proud contempt—having done the act, she now boasts of it. She laughs at what she's done. Well, in this case, if she gets her way and goes unpunished, then she's the man here, not me. No. She may be my sister's child, closer to me by blood than anyone belonging to my house who worships Zeus Herkeios\textsuperscript{17} in my home, but she'll not escape my harshest punishment—her sister, too, whom I accuse as well.

\textsuperscript{16} obdurate: hardhearted or inflexible
\textsuperscript{17} Zeus Herkeios: refers to an altar where sacrifices and libations were offered to Zeus; Zeus was the Divine protector of the house and the fence surrounding it; herkos means fence in Greek
She had an equal part in all their plans to do this burial. Go summon her here. I saw her just now inside the palace, her mind out of control, some kind of fit.

[Exit attendants into the palace to fetch Ismene]

When people hatch their mischief in the dark their minds often convict them in advance, betraying their treachery. How I despise a person caught committing evil acts who then desires to glorify the crime.

ANTIGONE
Take me and kill me—what more do you want?

CREON
Me? Nothing. With that I have everything.

ANTIGONE
Then why delay? There's nothing in your words that I enjoy—may that always be the case! And what I say displeases you as much. But where could I gain greater glory than setting my own brother in his grave? All those here would confirm this pleases them if their lips weren't sealed by fear—being king, which offers all sorts of various benefits, means you can talk and act just as you wish.

CREON
In all of Thebes, you're the only one who looks at things that way.

ANTIGONE
They share my views, but they keep their mouths shut just for you.

CREON
These views of yours—so different from the rest—don't they bring you any sense of shame?

ANTIGONE
No—there's nothing shameful in honouring my mother's children.

CREON
You had a brother killed fighting for the other side.

ANTIGONE
Yes—from the same mother and father, too.

CREON
But then give tributes which insult his name?

ANTIGONE
But his dead corpse won't back up what you say.

CREON
Yes, he will, if you give equal honours to a wicked man.

ANTIGONE
But the one who died was not some slave—it was his own brother.

CREON
Who was destroying this country—the other one went to his death defending it.

ANTIGONE
That may be, but Hades still desires equal rites for both.

---

18 Hades: King of the Underworld and god of the dead
CREON A good man does not wish what we give him to be the same an evil man receives.

ANTIGONE Who knows? In the world below perhaps such actions are no crime.

CREON An enemy can never be a friend, not even in death.

ANTIGONE But my nature is to love. I cannot hate.

CREON Then go down to the dead. If you must love, love them. No woman's going to govern me—no, no—not while I'm still alive.

[Enter two attendants from the house bringing Ismene to Creon]

CHORUS LEADER Ismene's coming. There—right by the door. She's crying. How she must love her sister! From her forehead a cloud casts its shadow down across her darkly flushing face—and drops its rain onto her lovely cheeks.

CREON You there—you snake lurking in my house, sucking out my life's blood so secretly. I'd no idea I was nurturing two pests, who aimed to rise against my throne. Come here. Tell me this—do you admit you played your part in this burial, or will you swear an oath you had no knowledge of it?

ISMENE I did it—I admit it, and she'll back me up. So I bear the guilt as well.

ANTIGONE No, no—justice will not allow you to say that. You didn't want to. I didn't work with you.

ISMENE But now you're in trouble, I'm not ashamed of suffering, too, as your companion.

ANTIGONE Hades and the dead can say who did it—I don't love a friend whose love is only words.

ISMENE You're my sister. Don't dishonour me. Let me respect the dead and die with you.

ANTIGONE Don't try to share my death or make a claim to actions which you did not do. I'll die—and that will be enough.

ISMENE But if you're gone, what is there in life for me to love?

ANTIGONE Ask Creon. He's the one you care about.

ISMENE Why hurt me like this? It doesn't help you.

ANTIGONE If I am mocking you, it pains me, too.

ISMENE Even now is there some way I can help?
ANTIGONE  Save yourself. I won't envy your escape.
ISMENE  I feel so wretched leaving you to die.
ANTIGONE  But you chose life—it was my choice to die.
ISMENE  But not before I'd said those words just now.
ANTIGONE  Some people may approve of how you think—
others will believe my judgment's good.
ISMENE  But the mistake's the same for both of us.
ANTIGONE  Be brave. You're alive. But my spirit died
some time ago so I might help the dead
CREON  I'd say one of these girls has just revealed
how mad she is—the other's been that way
since she was born.
ISMENE  My lord, whatever good sense
people have by birth no longer stays with them
once their lives go wrong—it abandons them.
CREON  In your case, that's true, once you made your choice
to act in evil ways with wicked people.
ISMENE  How could I live alone, without her here?
CREON  Don't speak of her being here. Her life is over.
ISMENE  You're going to kill your own son's bride?
CREON  Why not? There are other fields for him to plough.
ISMENE  No one will make him a more loving wife
than she will.
CREON  I have no desire my son should have an evil wife.
ANTIGONE  Dearest Haemon, how your father wrongs you.
CREON  I've had enough of this—you and your marriage.
ISMENE  You really want that? You're going to take her from him?
CREON  No, not me. Hades is the one who'll stop the marriage.
CHORUS LEADER  So she must die—that seems decided on.
CREON  Yes—for you and me the matter's closed.

[Creon turns to address his attendants]
No more delay. You slaves, take them inside.
From this point on they must act like women
and have no liberty to wander off.
Even bold men run when they see Hades
coming close to them to snatch their lives.

[The attendants take Antigone and ISMENE into the palace, leaving Creon and the Chorus on stage]
THIRD ODE

CHORUS – Strophe 1
Those who live without tasting evil
have happy lives—for when the gods
shake a house to its foundations,
then inevitable disasters strike,
falling upon whole families,
just as a surging ocean swell
running before cruel Thracian winds
across the dark trench of the sea
churns up the deep black sand
and crashes headlong on the cliffs,
which scream in pain against the wind.

Antistrophe 1
I see this house’s age-old sorrows,
the house of Labdakos’ children,
sorrows falling on the sorrows of the dead,
one generation bringing no relief
to generations after it—some god
strikes at them—on and on without an end.
For now the light which has been shining
over the last roots of Oedipus’ house
is being cut down with a bloody knife
belonging to the gods below—
for foolish talk and frenzy in the soul.

Strophe 2
Oh Zeus, what human trespasses
can check your power? Even Sleep,
who casts his nets on everything,
cannot master that—nor can the months,
the tireless months the gods control.
A sovereign who cannot grow old,
you hold Olympus as your own,
in all its glittering magnificence.
From now on into all future time,
as in the past, your law holds firm.
It never enters lives of human beings
in its full force without disaster.

Antistrophe 2
Hope ranging far and wide brings comfort
to many men—but then hope can deceive,
delusions born of volatile desire.
It comes upon the man who’s ignorant
until his foot is seared in burning fire.
Someone’s wisdom has revealed to us
this famous saying—sometimes the gods

19 Labdakos: father to Laius, grandfather to Oedipus
lure a man's mind forward to disaster, 
and he thinks evil's something good. 
But then he lives only the briefest time 
free of catastrophe.

[The palace doors open]

CHORUS LEADER Here comes Haemon, 
your only living son. Is he grieving 
the fate of Antigone, his bride, 
bitter that his marriage hopes are gone?

CREON We'll soon find out—more accurately 
than any prophet here could indicate.

[Enter Haemon from the palace]

My son, have you heard the sentence that's been passed 
upon your bride? And have you now come here 
angry at your father? Or are you loyal to me, 
on my side no matter what I do?

HAEMON Father, I'm yours. For me your judgments 
and the ways you act on them are good— 
I shall follow them. I'll not consider 
any marriage a greater benefit 
than your fine leadership.

CREON Indeed, my son, 
that's how your heart should always be resolved, 
to stand behind your father's judgment 
on every issue. That's what men pray for— 
obedient children growing up at home 
who will pay back their father's enemies, 
evil to them for evil done to him, 
while honouring his friends as much as he does. 
A man who fathers useless children— 
what can one say of him except he's bred 
troubles for himself, and much to laugh at 
for those who fight against him? So, my son, 
don't ever throw good sense aside for pleasure, 
for some woman's sake. You understand 
how such embraces can turn freezing cold 
when an evil woman shares your life at home. 
What greater wound is there than a false friend? 
So spit this girl out—she's your enemy. 
Let her marry someone else in Hades. 
Since I caught her clearly disobeying, 
the only culprit in the entire city, 
I won't perjure myself before the state. 
No—I'll kill her. And so let her appeal
to Zeus, the god of blood relationships.
If I foster any lack of full respect
in my own family, I surely do the same
with those who are not linked to me by blood.
The man who acts well with his household
will be found a just man in the city.
I'd trust such a man to govern wisely
or to be content with someone ruling him.

And in the thick of battle at his post
he'll stand firm beside his fellow soldier,
loyal, brave man. But anyone who's proud
and violates our laws or thinks he'll tell
our leaders what to do, a man like that
wins no praise from me. No. We must obey
whatever man the city puts in charge,
no matter what the issue—great or small,
just or unjust. For there's no greater evil
than a lack of leadership. That destroys
whole cities, turns households into ruins,
and in war makes soldiers break and run away.
When men succeed, what keeps their lives secure
in almost every case is their obedience.
That's why they must support those in control,
and never let some woman beat us down.

If we must fall from power, let that come
at some man's hand—at least, we won't be called
inferior to any woman.

Unless we're being deceived by our old age,
what you've just said seems reasonable to us.
Father, the gods instill good sense in men—
the greatest of all the things which we possess.
I could not find your words somehow not right—
I hope that's something I never learn to do.

But other words might be good, as well.
Because of who you are, you can't perceive
all the things men say or do—or their complaints.
Your gaze makes citizens afraid—they can't
say anything you would not like to hear.
But in the darkness I can hear them talk—
the city is upset about the girl.
They say of all women here she least deserves
the worst of deaths for her most glorious act.
When in the slaughter her own brother died,
she did not just leave him there unburied,
to be ripped apart by carrion dogs or birds.
Surely she deserves some golden honour?
That's the dark secret rumour people speak. For me, father, nothing is more valuable than your well being. For any children, what could be a greater honour to them than their father's thriving reputation? A father feels the same about his sons. So don't let your mind dwell on just one thought, that what you say is right and nothing else. A man who thinks that only he is wise, that he can speak and think like no one else, when such men are exposed, then all can see their emptiness inside. For any man, even if he's wise, there's nothing shameful in learning many things, staying flexible. You notice how in winter floods the trees which bend before the storm preserve their twigs. The ones who stand against it are destroyed, root and branch. In the same way, those sailors who keep their sails stretched tight, never easing off, make their ship capsize—and from that point on sail with their rowing benches all submerged. So end your anger. Permit yourself to change. For if I, as a younger man, may state my views, I'd say it would be for the best if men by nature understood all things—if not, and that is usually the case, when men speak well, it good to learn from them.

**CHORUS LEADER** My lord, if what he's said is relevant, it seems appropriate to learn from him, and you too, Haemon, listen to the king. The things which you both said were excellent.

**CREON** And men my age—are we then going to school to learn what's wise from men as young as him?

**HAEMON** There's nothing wrong in that. And if I'm young, don't think about my age—look at what I do.

**CREON** And what you do—does that include this, honouring those who act against our laws?

**HAEMON** I would not encourage anyone to show respect to evil men.

**CREON** And her— is she not suffering from the same disease?

**HAEMON** The people here in Thebes all say the same—they deny she is.
CREON
So the city now will instruct me how I am to govern?

HAEMON
Now you're talking like someone far too young. Don't you see that?

CREON
Am I to rule this land at someone else's whim or by myself?

HAEMON
A city which belongs to just one man is no true city.

CREON
According to our laws, does not the ruler own the city?

HAEMON
By yourself you'd make an excellent king but in a desert.

CREON
It seems as if this boy is fighting on the woman's side.

HAEMON
That's true—if you're the woman. I'm concerned for you.

CREON
You're the worst there is—you set your judgment up against your father.

HAEMON
No, not when I see you making a mistake and being unjust.

CREON
Is it a mistake to honour my own rule?

HAEMON
You're not honouring that by trampling on the gods' prerogatives.²⁰

CREON
You foul creature—you're worse than any woman.

HAEMON
You'll not catch me giving way to some disgrace.

CREON
But your words all speak on her behalf.

HAEMON
And yours and mine—and for the gods below.

CREON
You woman's slave—don't try to win me over.

HAEMON
What do you want—to speak and never hear someone reply?

CREON
You'll never marry her while she's alive.

HAEMON
Then she'll die—and in her death kill someone else.

²⁰ prerogatives: exclusive rights or privileges
CREON Are you so insolent you threaten me?

HAEMON Where's the threat in challenging a bad decree?

CREON You'll regret parading what you think like this—you—a person with an empty brain!

HAEMON If you were not my father, I might say you were not thinking straight.

CREON Would you, indeed?

HAEMON If you were not my father, I might say you were not thinking straight.

CREON Well, then, by Olympus, I'll have you know you'll be sorry for demeaning me with all these insults.

[Creon turns to his attendants]

Go bring her out—
that hateful creature, so she can die right here,
with him present, before her bridegroom's eyes.

HAEMON No. Don't ever hope for that. She'll not die with me just standing there. And as for you—your eyes will never see my face again.
So let your rage charge on among your friends who want to stand by you in this.

[Exit Haemon, running back into the palace]

CHORUS LEADER My lord, Haemon left in such a hurry.
He's angry—in a young man at his age the mind turns bitter when he's feeling hurt.

CREON Let him dream up or carry out great deeds beyond the power of man, he'll not save these girls—their fate is sealed.

CHORUS LEADER Are you going to kill them both?

CREON No—not the one whose hands are clean. You're right.

CHORUS LEADER How do you plan to kill Antigone?

CREON I'll take her on a path no people use,
and hide her in a cavern in the rocks,
while still alive. I'll set out provisions, as much as piety requires, to make sure the city is not totally corrupted.
Then she can speak her prayers to Hades, the only god she worships, for success avoiding death—or else, at least, she'll learn, although too late, how it's a waste of time to work to honour those whom Hades holds.

21 piety: devotion to religion; fulfillment of religious obligations
FOURTH ODE

CHORUS – Strophe
O Eros\(^22\), the conqueror in every fight,
Eros, who squanders all men's wealth,
who sleeps at night on girls' soft cheeks,
and roams across the ocean seas
and through the shepherd's hut—
no immortal god escapes from you,
nor any man, who lives but for a day.
And the one whom you possess goes mad.

Antistrophe
Even in good men you twist their minds,
perverting them to their own ruin.
You provoke these men to family strife.
The bride's desire seen glittering in her eyes—
that conquers everything, its power
enthroned beside eternal laws, for there
the goddess Aphrodite works her will,
whose ways are irresistible.

[Antigone enters from the palace with attendants who are taking her away to her execution]

910 CHORAL LEADER  When I look at her I forget my place.
I lose restraint and can’t hold back my tears—
Antigone going to her bridal room
where all are laid to rest in death.

COMMOS

ANTIGONE – Strophe 1
Look at me, my native citizens,
as I go on my final journey,
as I gaze upon the sunlight one last time,
which I'll never see again—for Hades,
who brings all people to their final sleep,
leads me on, while I’m still living,
down to the shores of Acheron.\(^23\)
I’ve not yet had my bridal chant,
nor has any wedding song been sung—
for my marriage is to Acheron.

CHORUS
Surely you carry fame with you and praise,
as you move to the deep home of the dead.
You were not stricken by lethal disease
or paid your wages with a sword.
No. You were in charge of your own fate.

---

\(^{22}\) Eros: god of love and son of Aphrodite
\(^{23}\) Acheron: a river in Hades across which the dead were ferried
So of all living human beings, you alone
make your way down to Hades still alive.

ANTIGONE – Antistrophe 1
I’ve heard about a guest of ours,
daughter of Tantalus\(^\text{24}\), from Phrygia—
she went to an excruciating death
in Sipylus\(^\text{25}\), right on the mountain peak.
The stone there, just like clinging ivy,
worst her down, and now, so people say,
the snow and rain never leave her there,
as she laments. Below her weeping eyes
her neck is wet with tears. God brings me
to a final rest which most resembles hers.

CHORUS
But Niobe\(^\text{26}\) was a goddess, born divine—
and we are human beings, a race which dies.
But still, it’s a fine thing for a woman,
once she’s dead, to have it said she shared,
in life and death, the fate of demi-gods.

ANTIGONE – Strophe 2
Oh, you are mocking me! Why me—
by our fathers’ gods—why do you all,
my own city and the richest men of Thebes,
insult me now right to my face,
without waiting for my death?
Well at least I have Dirce’s springs,
the holy grounds of Thebes,
a city full of splendid chariots,
to witness how no friends lament for me
as I move on—you see the laws
which lead me to my rock-bound prison,
a tomb made just for me. Alas!
In my wretchedness I have no home,
not with human beings or corpses,
not with the living or the dead.

CHORUS
You pushed your daring to the limit, my child,
and tripped against Justice’s high altar—
perhaps your agonies are paying back
some compensation for your father.

\(^\text{24}\) Tantalus: son of Zeus who was punished by being “tantalized” by food and drink that were always just out of his reach
\(^\text{25}\) Sipylus: mountain ruled by Tantalus; location of the weeping stone formation of Niobe
\(^\text{26}\) Niobe: daughter of Tantalus; all her children were killed and she was turned to stone; her rock formation appears to weep tears for her children as it rains
ANTIGONE – Antistrophe 2

Now there you touch on my most painful thought—
my father’s destiny—always on my mind,
along with that whole fate which sticks to us,
the splendid house of Labdakos—the curse
arising from a mother’s marriage bed,
when she had sex with her own son, my father.
From what kind of parents was I born,
their wretched daughter? I go to them,
unmarried and accursed, an outcast.
Alas, too, for my brother Polynices,
who made a fatal marriage and then died—and
with that death killed me while still alive.

CHORUS To be piously devout shows reverence,
but powerful men, who in their persons
incorporate authority, cannot bear
anyone to break their rules. Hence, you die
because of your own selfish will.

ANTIGONE – Epode 27

Without lament, without a friend,
and with no marriage song, I’m being led
in this miserable state, along my final road.
So wretched that I no longer have the right
to look upon the sun, that sacred eye.
But my fate prompts no tears, and no friend mourns.

CREON Don’t you know that no one faced with death
would ever stop the singing and the groans,
if that would help? Take her and shut her up,
as I have ordered, in her tomb’s embrace.
And get it done as quickly as you can.
Then leave her there alone, all by herself—
she can sort out whether she wants suicide
or remains alive, buried in a place like that.
As far as she’s concerned, we bear no guilt.
But she’s lost her place living here with us.

ANTIGONE Oh my tomb and bridal chamber—
my eternal hollow dwelling place,
where I go to join my people. Most of them
have perished—Persephone 28 has welcomed them
among the dead. I’m the last one, dying here
the most evil death by far, as I move down

27 Epode: final stanza of the ode; follows the strophe and antistrophe
28 Persephone: goddess of the underworld; she was abducted by Hades and forced to spend one third of each year
there, which is the winter during which nothing blooms or grows
before the time allotted for my life is done. But I go nourishing the vital hope my father will be pleased to see me come, and you, too, my mother, will welcome me, as well as you, my own dear brother.

When you died, with my own hands I washed you. I arranged your corpse and at the grave mound poured out libations. But now, Polyneices, this is my reward for covering your corpse. However, for wise people I was right to honour you. I'd never have done it for children of my own, not as their mother, nor for a dead husband lying in decay—no, not in defiance of the citizens. What law do I appeal to, claiming this? If my husband died, there'd be another one, and if I were to lose a child of mine I'd have another with some other man. But since my father and my mother, too, are hidden away in Hades' house, I'll never have another living brother. That was the law I used to honour you. But Creon thought that I was in the wrong and acting recklessly for you, my brother. Now he seizes me by force and leads me here—no wedding and no bridal song, no share in married life or raising children. Instead I go in sorrow to my grave, without my friends, to die while still alive. What holy justice have I violated? In my wretchedness, why should I still look up to the gods? Which one can I invoke to bring me help, when for my reverence they charge me with impiety? Well, then, if this is something fine among the gods, I'll come to recognize that I've done wrong. But if these people here are being unjust may they endure no greater punishment than the injustices they're doing to me.

CHORUS LEADER The same storm blasts continue to attack the mind in this young girl.

CREON Then those escorting her will be sorry they're so slow.

ANTIGONE Alas, then, those words mean death is very near at hand.
CREON  I won't encourage you or cheer you up,  
by saying the sentence won't be carried out.

ANTIGONE  O city of my fathers  
in this land of Thebes—  
and my ancestral gods,  
I am being led away.
No more delaying for me.  
Look on me, you lords of Thebes,  
the last survivor of your royal house,  
see what I have to undergo,  
the kind of men who do this to me,  
for paying reverence to true piety.

[Antigone is led away under escort]

FIFTH ODE

CHORUS – Strophe 1
In her brass-bound room fair Danae\(^29\) as well endured her separation from the heaven's light,  
a prisoner hidden in a chamber like a tomb,  
although she, too, came from a noble line.  
And she, my child, had in her care  
the liquid streaming golden seed of Zeus.  
But the power of fate is full of mystery.  
There's no evading it, no, not with wealth,  
or war, or walls, or black sea-beaten ships.

Antistrophe 1  
And the hot-tempered child of Dryas\(^30\),  
king of the Edonians, was put in prison,  
closed up in the rocks by Dionysus\(^31\),  
for his angry mocking of the god.  
There the dreadful flower of his rage slowly withered, and he came to know  
the god who in his frenzy he had mocked  
with his own tongue. For he had tried  
to hold in check women in that frenzy inspired by the god, the Bacchanalian fire.  
More than that—he'd made the Muses angry,  
challenging the gods who love the flute.

Strophe 2  
Beside the black rocks where the twin seas meet,  
by Thracian Salmydessos at the Bosphorus,  
close to the place where Ares dwells,

\(^{29}\) Danae: daughter of a king; Zeus fell in love with her and they had a son, Perseus  
\(^{30}\) child of Dryas: Dryas' son, who objected to the worship of Dionysus, was imprisoned and driven mad; later he  
was blinded by Zeus as additional punishment.  
\(^{31}\) Dionysus: Greek god of wine and son of Zeus
the war god witnessed the unholy wounds which blinded the two sons of Phineus, inflicted by his savage wife—the sightless holes cried out for someone to avenge those blows made with her sharpened comb in blood-stained hands.

Antistrophe 2

In their misery they wept, lamenting their wretched suffering, sons of a mother whose marriage had gone wrong. And yet, she was an offspring of an ancient family, the race of Erechtheus, raised far away, in caves surrounded by her father’s winds, Boreas’ child, a girl who raced with horses across steep hills—child of the gods. But she, too, my child, suffered much from the immortal Fates.

[Enter Teiresias, led by a young boy]

TEIRESIAS Lords of Thebes, we two have walked a common path, one person’s vision serving both of us. The blind require a guide to find their way.

CREON What news do you have, old Teiresias?

TEIRESIAS I’ll tell you—and you obey the prophet.

CREON I’ve not rejected your advice before.

TEIRESIAS That’s the reason why you’ve steered the city on its proper course.

CREON From my experience I can confirm the help you give.

TEIRESIAS Then know this—your luck is once more on fate’s razor edge.

CREON What? What you’ve just said makes me nervous.

TEIRESIAS You’ll know—once you hear the tokens of my art. As I was sitting in my ancient place receiving omens from the flights of birds who all come there where I can hear them, I note among those birds an unknown cry—evil, unintelligible, angry screaming. I knew that they were tearing at each other with murderous claws. The noisy wings revealed that all too well. I was afraid. So right away up on the blazing altar I set up burnt offerings. But Hephaestus

32 Phineus: King of Thrace, who imprisoned his first wife Cleopatra; his new wife blinded Cleopatra’s two sons out of jealousy.
failed to shine out from the sacrifice—
dark slime poured out onto the embers,
oozing from the thighs, which smoked and spat,
bile was sprayed high up into the air,
and the melting thighs lost all the fat
which they’d been wrapped in. The rites had failed—
there was no prophecy revealed in them.
I learned that from this boy, who is my guide,
as I guide other men. Our state is sick—
your policies have done this. In the city
our altars and our hearths have been defiled,
all of them, with rotting flesh brought there
by birds and dogs from Oedipus’ son,
who lies there miserably dead. The gods
no longer will accept our sacrifice,
our prayers, our thigh bones burned in fire.
No bird will shriek out a clear sign to us,
for they have gorged themselves on fat and blood
from a man who’s dead. Consider this, my son.
All men make mistakes—that’s not uncommon.

But when they do, they’re no longer foolish
or subject to bad luck if they try to fix
the evil into which they’ve fallen,
then they give up their intransigence.  
Men who put their stubbornness on show
invite accusations of stupidity.
Make concessions to the dead—don’t ever stab
a man who’s just been killed. What’s the glory
in killing a dead person one more time?
I’ve been concerned for you. It’s good advice.
Learning can be pleasant when a man speaks well,
especially when he seeks your benefit.

CREON

Old man, you’re all like archers shooting at me—
For you all I’ve now become your target—
even prophets have been aiming at me.
I’ve long been bought and sold as merchandise
among that tribe. Well, go make your profits.
If it’s what you want, then trade with Sardis
for their golden-silver alloy—or for gold
from India, but you’ll never hide that corpse
in any grave. Even if Zeus’ eagles
should choose to seize his festering body
and take it up, right to the throne of Zeus,
not even then would I, in trembling fear

33 intransigence: being unwilling to agree or compromise
of some defilement, permit that corpse a burial. For I know well that no man has the power to pollute the gods. But, old Teiresias, among human beings the wisest suffer a disgraceful fall when, to promote themselves, they use fine words to spread around abusive insults.

TEIRESIAS  Alas, does any man know or think about . . .

CREON [interrupting]  Think what? What sort of pithy common thought are you about to utter?

TEIRESIAS [ignoring the interruption] . . . how good advice is valuable—worth more than all possessions.

CREON  I think that’s true, as much as foolishness is what harms us most.

TEIRESIAS  Yet that’s the sickness now infecting you.

CREON  I have no desire to denigrate a prophet when I speak.

TEIRESIAS  But that’s what you are doing, when you claim my oracles are false.

CREON  The tribe of prophets—all of them—are fond of money

TEIRESIAS  And kings? Their tribe loves to benefit dishonestly.

CREON  You know you’re speaking of the man who rules you.

TEIRESIAS  I know—thanks to me you saved the city and now are in control.

CREON  You’re a wise prophet, but you love doing wrong.

TEIRESIAS  You’ll force me to speak of secrets locked inside my heart.

CREON  Do it—just don’t speak to benefit yourself.

TEIRESIAS  I don’t think that I’ll be doing that—not as far as you’re concerned.

CREON  You can be sure you won’t change my mind to make yourself more rich.

34 denigrate: slander, criticize
TEIRESIAS Then understand this well—you will not see
the sun race through its cycle many times
before you lose a child of your own loins,
a corpse in payment for these corpses.
You’ve thrown down to those below someone
from up above—in your arrogance
you’ve moved a living soul into a grave,
leaving here a body owned by gods below—
unburied, dispossessed, unsanctified.
That’s no concern of yours or gods above.
In this you violate the ones below.
And so destroying avengers wait for you,
Furies of Hades and the gods, who’ll see
you caught up in this very wickedness.
Now see if I speak as someone who’s been bribed.
It won’t be long before in your own house
the men and women all cry out in sorrow,
and cities rise in hate against you—all those
whose mangled soldiers have had burial rites
from dogs, wild animals, or flying birds
who carry the unholy stench back home,
to every city hearth. Like an archer,
I shoot these arrows now into your heart
because you have provoked me. I’m angry— so my aim is good. You’ll not escape their pain.
Boy, lead us home so he can vent his rage
on younger men and keep a quieter tongue
and a more temperate mind than he has now.

[Exit Teiresias, led by the young boy]

CHORUS LEADER My lord, my lord, such dreadful prophecies—
and now he’s gone. Since my hair changed colour
from black to white, I know here in the city
he’s never uttered a false prophecy.

CREON I know that, too—and it disturbs my mind.
It’s dreadful to give way, but to resist
and let destruction hammer down my spirit—
that’s a fearful option, too.

CHORUS LEADER Son of Menoikeos,
you need to listen to some good advice.

CREON Tell me what to do. Speak up. I’ll do it.

CHORUS LEADER Go and release the girl from her rock tomb.
Then prepare a grave for that unburied corpse.

CREON This is your advice? You think I should concede?
CHORUS LEADER  Yes, my lord, as fast as possible.
    Swift footed injuries sent from the gods
    hack down those who act imprudently.

CREON    Alas—it’s difficult. But I’ll give up.
    I’ll not do what I’d set my heart upon.
    It’s not right to fight against necessity.

CHORUS LEADER  Go now and get this done. Don’t give the work
    to other men to do.

CREON          I’ll go just as I am.
    Come, you servants, each and every one of you.
    Come on. Bring axes with you. Go there quickly—
    up to the higher ground. I’ve changed my mind.
    Since I’m the one who tied her up, I’ll go
    and set her free myself. Now I’m afraid.
    Until one dies the best thing well may be
    to follow our established laws.

[Creon and his attendants hurry off stage]

SIXTH ODE

CHORUS – Strophe 1
    Oh you with many names,
    you glory of that Theban bride,
    and child of thundering Zeus,
    you who cherish famous Italy,
    and rule the welcoming valley lands
    of Eleusian Deo—
    O Bacchus—you who dwell
    in the bacchants’ mother city Thebes,
    beside Ismenus35 flowing streams,
    on land sown with the teeth
    of that fierce dragon.

Antistrophe 1
    Above the double mountain peaks,
    the torches flashing through the murky smoke
    have seen you where Corcyian nymphs
    move on as they worship you
    by the Kastalian stream.
    And from the ivy-covered slopes
    of Nysa’s hills, from the green shore
    so rich in vines, you come to us,
    visiting our Theban ways,
    while deathless voices all cry out
    in honour of your name, “Evoe.”36

---

35 Ismenus: river near Thebes, sacred to Apollo
36 Evoe: similar to hallelujah, a cry of joy shouted by worshipers at festivals
Strophe 2
You honour Thebes, our city,
above all others, you and your mother
blasted by that lightning strike.
And now when all our people here
are captive to a foul disease,
on your healing feet you come
across the moaning strait
or over the Parnassian hill.

Antistrophe 2
You who lead the dance,
among the fire-breathing stars,
who guard the voices in the night,
child born of Zeus, oh my lord,
appear with your attendant Thyiads,
who dance in frenzy all night long,
for you their patron, Iacchus. 37

[Enter a Messenger]
MESSENGER
All you here who live beside the home
of Amphion and Cadmus—in human life
there’s no set place which I would praise or blame.
The lucky and unlucky rise or fall
by chance day after day—and how these things
are fixed for men no one can prophesy.
For Creon, in my view, was once a man
we all looked up to. For he saved the state,
this land of Cadmus, from its enemies.
He took control and reigned as its sole king—
and prospered with the birth of noble children.
Now all is gone. For when a man has lost
what gives him pleasure, I don’t include him
among the living—he’s a breathing corpse.
Pile up a massive fortune in your home,
if that’s what you want—live like a king.
If there’s no pleasure in it, I’d not give
to any man a vapour’s shadow for it,
not compared to human joy.

CHORUS LEADER
Have you come with news of some fresh trouble
in our house of kings?
MESSENGER
They’re dead—
and those alive bear the responsibility
for those who’ve died.
CHORUS LEADER
Who did the killing?
Who’s lying dead? Tell us.

37 Iacchus: another name for Dionysus
MESSENGER Haemon has been killed.
No stranger shed his blood.

CHORUS LEADER At his father’s hand?
Or did he kill himself?

MESSENGER By his own hand—
angry at his father for the murder.

CHORUS LEADER Teiresias, how your words have proven true!
MESSENGER That’s how things stand. Consider what comes next.

CHORUS LEADER I see Creon’s wife, poor Eurydice—
she’s coming from the house—either by chance,
or else she’s heard there’s news about her son.

[Enter Eurydice from the palace with some attendants]

EURYDICE Citizens of Thebes, I heard you talking,
as I was walking out, going off to pray,
to ask for help from goddess Pallas.
While I was unfastening the gate,
I heard someone speaking of bad news
about my family. I was terrified.
I collapsed, fainting back into the arms
of my attendants. So tell the news again—
I’ll listen. I’m no stranger to misfortune.

MESSENGER Dear lady, I’ll speak of what I saw,
omitting not one detail of the truth.
Why should I ease your mind with a report
which turns out later to be incorrect?
The truth is always best. I went to the plain,
accompanying your husband as his guide.
Polyneices’ corpse, still un lamented,
was lying there, the greatest distance off,
torn apart by dogs. We prayed to Pluto
and to Hecate, goddess of the road,
for their good will and to restrain their rage.
We gave the corpse a ritual wash, and burned
what was left of it on fresh-cut branches.
We piled up a high tomb of his native earth.
Then we moved to the young girl’s rocky cave,
the hollow cavern of that bride of death.
From far away one man heard a voice
coming from the chamber where we’d put her
without a funeral—a piercing cry.
He went to tell our master Creon,
who, as he approached the place, heard the sound,
an unintelligible scream of sorrow.
He groaned and then spoke out these bitter words, “Has misery made me a prophet now? And am I travelling along a road that takes me to the worst of all disasters? I’ve just heard the voice of my own son. You servants, go ahead—get up there fast. Remove the stones piled in the entrance way, then stand beside the tomb and look in there to see if that was Haemon’s voice I heard, or if the gods have been deceiving me.”

Following what our desperate master asked, we looked. In the furthest corner of the tomb we saw Antigone hanging by the neck, held up in a noose—fine woven linen. Haemon had his arms around her waist—he was embracing her and crying out in sorrow for the loss of his own bride, now among the dead, his father’s work, and for his horrifying marriage bed. Creon saw him, let out a fearful groan, then went inside and called out anxiously, “You unhappy boy, what have you done? What are you thinking? Have you lost your mind? Come out, my child—I’m begging you—please come.” But the boy just stared at him with savage eyes, spat in his face and, without saying a word, drew his two-edged sword. Creon moved away, so the boy’s blow failed to strike his father. Angry at himself, the ill-fated lad right then and there leaned into his own sword, driving half the blade between his ribs. While still conscious he embraced the girl in his weak arms, and, as he breathed his last, he coughed up streams of blood on her fair cheek. Now he lies there, corpse on corpse, his marriage has been fulfilled in chambers of the dead. The unfortunate boy has shown all men how, of all the evils which afflict mankind, the most disastrous one is thoughtlessness.

[Charting the Action]

[1210]

[1220]

[1230]

[1240]

[1250]

[1260]

[1270]

[1280]

[1290]

[1300]

[1310]

[1320]

[1330]

[1340]

[1350]

[1360]

[1370]

[1380]

[1390]

[Eurydice turns and slowly returns into the palace]

CHORUS LEADER What do you make of that? The queen’s gone back. She left without a word, good or bad.

MESSENGER I’m surprised myself. It’s about her son—she heard that terrible report. I hope she’s gone because she doesn’t think it right.

1390
to mourn for him in public. In the home, surrounded by her servants, she'll arrange a period of mourning for the house. She's discreet and has experience—she won't make mistakes.

CHORUS LEADER I'm not sure of that. To me her staying silent was extreme—it seems to point to something ominous, just like a vain excess of grief.

MESSENGER I'll go in. We'll find out if she's hiding something secret, deep within her passionate heart. You're right—excessive silence can be dangerous.

[The Messenger goes up the stairs into the palace. Enter Creon from the side, with attendants. Creon is holding the body of Haemon]

CHORUS LEADER Here comes the king in person—carrying in his arms, if it's right to speak of this, a clear reminder that this evil comes not from some stranger, but his own mistakes.

CREON — Strophe 1 Aaiii—mistakes made by a foolish mind, cruel mistakes that bring on death. You see us here, all in one family—the killer and the killed. Oh the profanity of what I planned. Alas, my son, you died so young—a death before your time. Aaiii . . . aaiii . . . you're dead . . . gone—not your own foolishness but mine.

CHORUS LEADER Alas, it seems you've learned to see what's right—but far too late.

CREON Aaiii . . . I've learned it in my pain. Some god clutching a great weight struck my head, then hurled me onto paths in wilderness, throwing down and casting underfoot what brought me joy. So sad . . . so sad . . . the wretched agony of human life.

[The Messenger reappears from the palace]

MESSENGER My lord, you come like one who stores up evil, what you hold in your arms and what you'll see before too long inside the house.
Charting the Action

CREON What's that?
Is there something still more evil than all this?

MESSENGER Your wife is dead—blood mother of that corpse—slaughtered with a sword—her wounds are very new, poor lady.

CREON – Antistrophe 1 Aaiii . . . a gathering place for death . . .
1430 no sacrifice can bring this to an end.
Why are you destroying me? You there—
you bringer of this dreadful news, this agony,
what are you saying now? Aaii . . .
You kill a man then kill him once again.
What are you saying, boy? What news?

[1290] A slaughter heaped on slaughter—
my wife, alas . . . she's dead?

MESSENGER [opening the palace doors, revealing the body of Eurydice]
Look here. No longer is she concealed inside.

CREON Alas, how miserable I feel—to look upon
this second horror. What remains for me,
what's fate still got in store? I've just held
my own son in my arms, and now I see
right here in front of me another corpse.

[1300] Alas for this suffering mother.
Alas, my son.

MESSENGER Stabbed with a sharp sword at the altar,
she let her darkening eyesight fail,
once she had cried out in sorrow
for the glorious fate of Megareos,38
who died some time ago, and then again
for Haemon, and then, with her last breath,
she called out evil things against you,
the killer of your sons.

CREON – Strophe 2 Aaaaii . . . My fear now makes me tremble.
Why won't someone now strike out at me,
pierce my heart with a double bladed sword?

[1310] How miserable I am . . . aaii . . .
how full of misery and pain . . .

MESSENGER By this woman who lies dead you stand charged
with the deaths of both your sons.

38 Megareos: youngest son of Creon and Eurydice; an inexperienced soldier who died in battle
CREON  What about her?
How did she die so violently?

MESSENGER  She killed herself,
with her own hands she stabbed her belly,
only she heard a son's unhappy fate.

CREON  Alas for me . . . the guilt for all of this is mine—
it can never be removed from me or passed
to any other mortal man. I, and I alone . . .
I murdered you . . . I speak the truth.
Servants—hurry and lead me off,
get me away from here, for now
what I am in life is nothing.

CHORUS LEADER  What you advise is good—if good can come
with all these evils. When we face such things
the less we say the better.

CREON – Antistrophe 2
Let that day come, oh let it come,
the fairest of all destinies for me,
the one which brings on my last day.
Oh, let it come, so that I never see
another dawn.

CHORUS LEADER  That's something for the times ahead.
Now we need to deal with what confronts us here.
What's yet to come is the concern of those
whose task it is to deal with it.

CREON  In that prayer
I included everything I most desire.

CHORUS  Pray for nothing.
There's no release for mortal human beings,
not from events which destiny has set.

CREON  Then take this foolish man away from here.
I killed you, my son, without intending to,
and you, as well, my wife. How useless I am now.
I don't know where to look or find support.
Everything I touch goes wrong, and on my head
fate climbs up with its overwhelming load.

[The Attendants help Creon move up the stairs into the palace, taking Haemon's body with them]

CHORUS  The most important part of true success
is wisdom—not to act impiously
towards the gods, for boasts of arrogant men
bring on great blows of punishment—
so in old age men can discover wisdom.
Antigone in the Amphitheater

Choose one of the scenes from Antigone that you found appealing. Taking into consideration what you have learned about Greek performances, visualize what that scene would look like if it were performed on a stage, without sound or lighting devices or elaborate costumes or sets.

Scene: ________________________________________________

Main characters: ________________________________________________________________

What is the important action in this section? __________________________________________

Pretend the circle below is an empty stage in a large amphitheater. Where will you place your actors? Why? What will the actors need to do to make the audience understand what is happening? Label your actors and any particular ways your Chorus moves.

Performance Arena

SUGGESTED LEARNING STRATEGIES: Sketching, Visualizing, Think-Pair-Share
Creon’s Changing Character

SUGGESTED LEARNING STRATEGIES: Graphic Organizer

Nonfiction

MAKING COMICS

by Scott McCloud

THE DIFFERENT KINDS OF FACIAL
EXPRESSIONS AND WHERE THEY COME
FROM.

HOW THOSE EXPRESSIONS ARE
FORMED BY THE MUSCLES OF
THE FACE.

THE VARIOUS STRATEGIES FOR
RENDERING THOSE EXPRESSIONS
GRAPHICALLY.

AND HOW FACIAL EXPRESSIONS WORK
IN COMICS-STYLE SEQUENCES.

PUTTING FACIAL EXPRESSOINS TO USE IN COMICS REQUIRES YOU TO TACKLE FOUR SUBJECTS:

THE HUMAN FACE CAN TAKE ON
ANY NUMBER OF SHAPES IN
THE COURSE OF A DAY.

SOME INDICATE PHYSICAL
STATES SUCH AS PAIN OR
EXHAUSTION.

SOME ARE MEANT TO
COMMUNICATE
DIRECTLY.

BUT THE LION’S
SHARE OF THE
FACE’S POWER TO MOVE
US LIES IN ITS ABILITY
TO CONVEY BASIC
HUMAN EMOTIONS.

THE RESULTS OF THAT PROCESS
CAN BE VARIED AND
COMPLEX, BUT AT ITS
SOURCE ARE A FEW
SIMPLE BUILDING
BLOCKS.

IN 1872, DARWIN
WRANED THAT SOME
EXPRESSIONS MIGHT BE
UNIVERSAL, A VIEW
SHARED BY MODERN
EXPRESSIONS EXPERTS
LIKE PAUL EKMAN.

THESE ARE THE BASIC EMOTIONS WHICH
ALL HUMAN BEINGS EXHIBIT, REGARDLESS OF
CULTURE, LANGUAGE OR AGE. A SMALL
HANDFUL OF “PURE” EXPRESSIONS FROM WHICH
OTHERS ARE DERIVED.

SIX OF THEM, TO BE EXACT.
Creon’s Changing Character

For example, by varying the intensity of our primaries you can see other familiar emotions emerge.

Sternness Indignation Anger Rage
Disdain Aversion Disgust Revulsion
Concern Anxiety Fear Terror
Satisfaction Amusement Joy Laughter
Dejection Melancholy Sadness Grief
Alertness Wonder Surprise Shock
Draw a series of masks that record character changes in Creon, scene by scene. Your masks should express changes in his emotions and attitude. Below each mask, write words or lines from the play that support your interpretation. Also, explain how you think Creon would deliver these lines on stage. Space is provided for your work with the first two scenes; use your own paper for the third through seventh scenes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>First Scene (Ends with First Ode)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mask</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Emotions and Attitude</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Textual Support</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Delivery of Lines</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Second Scene (Ends with Second Ode)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mask</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Emotions and Attitude</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Textual Support</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Delivery of Lines</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Is it ever justifiable to break the law? Examine that question by putting Antigone on trial for disobeying the king’s order and by putting Creon on trial for condemning a woman to death for following her principles. You will be assigned a role in a courtroom and asked to use textual support as the basis for your performance when you speak during the trial.

After you are assigned a role, look through the text to formulate questions and find quotations that support your character’s position in the play.

The major roles in Antigone’s trial require you to do the following:

- **Antigone**: Plead not guilty; find textual support and cultural reasons for your position.
- **Her lawyer**: Formulate questions for your client and witnesses who will help her case. Prepare a closing argument that uses at least one persuasive appeal.
- **Prosecutor**: Formulate questions for Antigone and witnesses who will condemn her.
- **Judge**: Listen to all sides and be prepared to give orders as needed (be familiar with some judicial proceedings and terms).
- **Jurors (chorus)**: Listen impartially, take notes, and be prepared to render a unanimous verdict based on evidence presented.
- **Witnesses (Creon, Eurydice, Haemon, the guard, Ismene, messenger)**: Find textual support for testifying in court and be prepared to answer the lawyer’s questions with appropriate lines from the play.

The major roles in Creon’s trial require you to do the following:

- **Creon**: Plead not guilty; find textual support and cultural reasons for your position.
- **His lawyer**: Formulate questions for your client and witnesses who will help his case. Prepare a closing argument that uses at least one persuasive appeal.
- **Prosecutor**: Formulate questions for Creon and witnesses who will condemn him.
- **Judge —** Listen to all sides and be prepared to give orders as needed (be familiar with some judicial proceedings and terms).
- **Jurors (chorus)**: Listen impartially, take notes, and be prepared to render a unanimous verdict based on evidence presented.
- **Witnesses (Antigone, Eurydice, Haemon, the guard, Ismene, messenger)**: Find textual support for testifying in court and be prepared to answer the lawyer’s questions with appropriate lines from the play.
Your role: ______________________________________________________

Lines you will use as textual support for your position: (Use questions
if you are a lawyer.)
(Choose at least 10 lines to support your role.)

What was the outcome of the trial?

Who do you think was the most convincing and why?

How has the mock trial activity influenced your thinking about the
esential questions in this unit? What have you learned about the
nature of justice? What have you learned about constructing
persuasive arguments?
Now think back to the question: “Is it ever justifiable to break the law?”
How did you initially respond to that question?

What about now?

Describe your progress toward your goals for speaking and listening in presentation situations like this one. Refine your goals as needed.
Imagine Antigone in other cultures and historical time periods. How might her fate be different if she committed the same crime in a different setting?

Place her in the times and places shown in the chart below and predict, based on the knowledge you have of that culture, what might happen to her. In the bottom row, add a time and place of your own choosing and make a prediction.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time or Place</th>
<th>Punishment</th>
<th>Cultural Elements that Influence Your Opinion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Modern America</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern Singapore</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria in the late nineteenth century</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© 2011 College Board. All rights reserved.
Think back to *Antigone* and Kohlberg’s levels of moral development that you read about earlier in the unit.

Imagine the character of Antigone operating at each stage of moral development. How would her character respond to her dilemma? Use the space below to record your thoughts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Would she have gone against the king’s order and buried her brother?</th>
<th>Why or Why Not?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-conventional</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conventional</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-conventional</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Work with a small group to come to a consensus on how a character in Antigone’s situation might behave at each of the stages of moral development.

2. Next, create a series of tableaux that show a character at each stage of development. Remember that a tableau is like a snapshot or an action frozen in time. Also, keep in mind the analysis of art you completed in Activity 4.11 as you act out Antigone at different stages of her moral development.
The Chorus serves an important role in Greek theater, commenting on the issues relevant to the play. One of the important issues in *Antigone* is the power of love (Eros). Reread closely the lines of the Chorus in the Fourth Ode on page 310. Mark the text for these elements:

- Diction
- Allusions
- Figurative language
- Beliefs of the ancient Greeks

Summarize what the Chorus is saying about love. Be sure to find support in the text.

Compare and contrast the Chorus’s belief about love with beliefs about love that your culture holds.
How does the Chorus construct a persuasive argument?

Work with a small group to write an ode on the subject of love. Be sure to emulate the style of the Greek Chorus, including a Strophe and an Antistrophe, but make the content reflect your own beliefs. Use separate paper.

Writing a choral ode is one part of Embedded Assessment 2. With that in mind, consider the process you and your group used to write collaboratively. Write a reflection to guide your work later, including your thoughts on what worked and what you would do differently.

Brainstorm issues of justice in Antigone, listing as many as you can:

Choose one of these issues and connect it to modern thinking and beliefs.
Creating a Living Tableau

SUGGESTED LEARNING STRATEGIES: Discussion Groups, Role Play, Notetaking

Your assignment is to work with a group of six or seven other students to create a living tableau that presents an issue of justice and incorporates lines from *Antigone* and an original choral ode. Your tableau will reflect your understanding of the beliefs about justice reflected in *Antigone* and beliefs about justice reflected in your own culture.

**Steps**

**Planning**

1. With your group, identify an issue of justice in *Antigone*. Discuss the beliefs of ancient Greeks, providing textual support from the drama.

2. Find scenes in which this issue of justice is central. Highlight key lines that illustrate the issue of justice. Discuss the scenes and key lines as a group. Consider: Who speaks these lines? What is the subtext of these lines? What might the other characters be thinking and feeling in response to these lines? How does your group feel about these lines?

3. Build consensus about your group’s collective stance on the issue, always maintaining respect for individuals’ opinions. Analyze why your group responds as you do to the issue of justice.

4. Find what the chorus says about the issue, if they say anything.

5. Elect a director who will lead your group in rehearsals and introduce and conclude your presentation.

6. Choose roles for the presentation; except for the director, each student will play either a character or a member of the Chorus. Create a director’s or actor’s notebook. Take notes during discussions and rehearsals and save them in your notebook.

**Creating**

7. In your final presentation, you will play different roles (character, Chorus, director), but the whole group should contribute to the presentation (introduction, tableau, ode, and conclusion).

8. Create masks that reflect analysis of the characters and the Chorus’s responses to the issue of justice. Draft an explanation about the message you were trying to convey with your mask.

9. **Living tableau:** The group must agree on the key lines from the play each actor will bring to life. You may write lines for some characters if the need arises, but be sure to prepare a rationale for taking this liberty.

10. Think about the order of the delivery of lines and arrange them in a purposeful sequence.
11. Analyze how the subtext of each character’s thoughts and feelings about the issue might be conveyed during the tableau presentation.

12. Choral Ode: The group will collaborate on writing a choral commentary (Strophe and Antistrophe) on the issue of justice that reflects your contemporary perspective. Emulate the style of the Chorus without copying the content.

13. Introduction and conclusion: Your group should collaborate on an introduction, which includes an engaging hook, and a conclusion that compares and contrasts the group’s stance on the issue to the stance reflected in Antigone.

Refining and Presenting

14. The actors portraying characters should practice arranging themselves in a way that reflects the various characters’ perspectives on the issue of justice. Consider overall aesthetic appeal, proximity of characters to each other, height of characters in relation to each other, body language, frozen gestures, and so on.

15. Rehearse delivering your assigned lines. When you say your line, you will “unfreeze,” using gestures to enhance the delivery of your lines. Consider wearing name tags to help the audience recognize each character in the tableau.

16. The actors portraying the Chorus should rehearse the Choral Ode that your group has written. Practice using movement and choral chanting, demonstrating your understanding of the tradition of Greek theater.

17. The director should rehearse introducing your presentation with an engaging hook and concluding the presentation by comparing and contrasting your group’s stance on the issue to the stance reflected in Antigone. The director should prepare to moderate a discussion about the presentation.

18. After the presentation, you will write a reflection on your experience and the audience will write a reflection on how this issue from an ancient play is relevant in modern times.

**TECHNOLOGY TIP** You may want to use software to create a multimedia presentation with graphics, images, and sound. Remember to convey a distinctive point of view with an appeal for your particular audience.
# SCORING GUIDE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scoring Criteria</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ideas of Presentation</strong></td>
<td>The group demonstrates a deep understanding of the drama by:</td>
<td>The group demonstrates a clear understanding of the play by:</td>
<td>The group fails to demonstrate a complete understanding of the play by:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• intentionally choosing lines that specifically represent an issue of justice;</td>
<td>• sufficiently choosing lines that represent an issue of justice;</td>
<td>• failing to choose lines that accurately represent an issue of justice;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• expertly incorporating an introduction and conclusion that illuminate an understanding of beliefs in <em>Antigone</em> as well as modern beliefs;</td>
<td>• adequately incorporating an introduction and conclusion that illuminates an understanding of beliefs in <em>Antigone</em> as well as modern beliefs;</td>
<td>• ineffectively incorporating an introduction and conclusion that illuminates an understanding of beliefs in <em>Antigone</em> as well as modern beliefs;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• seamlessly integrating masks that carefully analyze characters in relation to the issues of justice and are true to Greek theater.</td>
<td>• smoothly integrating masks that carefully analyze characters in relation to the issues of justice and are true to Greek theater.</td>
<td>• awkwardly integrating masks that carefully analyze characters in relation to the issues of justice and are true to Greek theater.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Delivery of Presentation</strong></td>
<td>The arrangement of the actors and delivery of lines are purposeful in reflecting various perspectives on the issue of justice.</td>
<td>The arrangement of the actors and delivery of lines adequately reflect the various perspectives on the issue of justice.</td>
<td>The arrangement of the actors and delivery of lines inadequately reflect the various perspectives on the issue of justice.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The overall organization of the tableau shows an impressive commitment to the acting and performance process.</td>
<td>The overall organization of the tableau shows sufficient commitment to the acting and performance process.</td>
<td>The tableau is disorganized and shows little commitment to the acting and performance process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Choral Odes</strong></td>
<td>The written text and delivery of choral commentary skillfully emulate the tradition of Greek theater to exemplify a perspective on the issue of justice.</td>
<td>The written text and delivery of choral commentary emulate the tradition of Greek theater to show a perspective on the issue of justice.</td>
<td>The written text and delivery of choral commentary do not accurately emulate tradition of Greek theater and do little to show a perspective on the issue of justice.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### SCORING GUIDE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scoring Criteria</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reflective Texts</strong></td>
<td>One text insightfully demonstrates the writer’s metacognitive evaluation of his/her participation as a creator and presenter of the tableau. A second text demonstrates the writer’s reflection on his/her role as an audience member by thoroughly analyzing how the issue of justice in an ancient play is relevant in modern times.</td>
<td>One text demonstrates the writer’s metacognitive evaluation of his/her participation as a creator and presenter of the tableau. A second text demonstrates the writer’s reflection on his/her role as an audience member by discussing how the issue of justice in an ancient play is relevant in modern times.</td>
<td>One text does little to evaluate the writer’s metacognition of his/her participation as a creator and presenter of the tableau. A second text attempts to demonstrate the writer’s reflection on his/her role as an audience member yet insufficiently analyzes how the issue of justice in an ancient play is relevant in modern times.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Additional Criteria** | | | |
|-------------------------| | | |

**Comments:**

_________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________
Reflection

An important aspect of growing as a learner is to reflect on where you have been, what you have accomplished, what helped you to learn, and how you will apply your new knowledge in the future. Use the following questions to guide your thinking and to identify evidence of your learning. Use separate notebook paper.

**Thinking about Concepts**

1. Using specific examples from this unit, respond to the Essential Questions:
   - What is the nature of justice?
   - How does one construct a persuasive argument?

2. Consider the new academic vocabulary from this unit *(Justice, Chorus)* as well as academic vocabulary from previous units, and select 3-4 terms of which your understanding has grown. For each term, answer the following questions:
   - What was your understanding of the word prior to the unit?
   - How has your understanding of the word evolved throughout the unit?
   - How will you apply your understanding in the future?

**Thinking about Connections**

1. Review the activities and products (artifacts) you created. Choose those that most reflect your growth or increase in understanding.

4. For each artifact that you choose, record, respond to, and reflect on your thinking and understanding, using the following questions as a guide:
   a. What skill/knowledge does this artifact reflect, and how did you learn this skill/knowledge?
   b. How did your understanding of the power of language expand through your engagement with this artifact?
   c. How will you apply this skill or knowledge in the future?

5. Create this reflection as Portfolio pages—one for each artifact you choose. Use the model in the box for your headings and commentary on questions.

---

**Thinking About Thinking**

*Portfolio Entry*

Concept:

Description of Artifact:

Commentary on Questions: